



## **Bill Analysis**

Author: Gloria

Bill Number: AB 1184

**Subject:** Public Records/Retention of Writing Transmitted by Electronic Mail

### **Summary**

This bill would, under the Government Code (GC), modify the California Public Records Act (CPRA), as specified.

This analysis only addresses the provisions of the bill that impact the department's programs and operations.

### **Reason for the Bill**

The reason for this bill is to ensure that public record retention requirements are appropriately applied to emails, given their increasing importance in how public agencies conduct their work.

### **Effective/Operative Date**

This bill would be effective on January 1, 2020, and operative as of that date.

### **State Law**

Current state tax law provides that information collected on income tax returns is considered confidential and, unless specifically available for other uses, must be used only to administer the income tax laws. The Franchise Tax Board (FTB) may disclose taxpayer information only in limited circumstances and only to specific agencies as authorized by law. Improper disclosure of federal tax information is punishable as a felony, and improper disclosure of state tax information is punishable as a misdemeanor.

Current state law, under the CPRA,<sup>1</sup> generally requires that state and local agencies make available for inspection "public records," unless otherwise exempted. State law specifically exempts income tax return information that would be prohibited from disclosure under the Revenue and Taxation Code (R&TC) from disclosure under the CPRA.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> GC section 6251.

<sup>2</sup> R&TC section 19542.

Public agencies generally must provide copies of disclosable public records within 10 days. The requestor generally must reimburse the state for the cost of duplication of paper or electronic copies. For information available in an electronic format, the CPRA also requires the requester cover the cost of producing a copy of the record, including the cost to construct a record, and the cost of programming and computer services necessary to produce a copy of the record, if either of the following applies:

- The public agency would be required to produce a copy of an electronic record and the record is one that is produced only at otherwise regularly scheduled intervals.
- The request would require data compilation, extraction, or programming to produce the record.

The CPRA defines the following terms, among others:

“Public record” means “any writing containing information relating to the conduct of the public’s business prepared, owned, used, or retained by any state or local agency regardless of physical form or characteristics.”

“Writing” means “any handwriting, typewriting, printing, photostating, photographing, photocopying, transmitting by electronic mail or facsimile, and every other means of recording upon any tangible thing any form of communication or representation, including letters, words, pictures, sounds, or symbols, or combinations thereof, and any record thereby created, regardless of the manner in which the record has been stored.”

Current state law, under the State Records Management Act (SRMA),<sup>3</sup> generally requires each state agency to establish and maintain a records management and retention program. For purposes of the SRMA, “public records” have the same meaning as under the CPRA. The retention period is generally determined by the state agency, and consideration must be given to the usefulness or significance of the record, regardless of physical form or characteristics.

### **This Bill**

This bill, under the GC, would require a public agency, for the purposes of the CPRA, to retain and preserve for at least two years every public record, as defined in the CPRA<sup>4</sup> that is transmitted by electronic mail, unless a longer retention period is required by statute, or regulation, or by the Secretary of State, pursuant to the SRMA.

---

<sup>3</sup> GC sections 12270 through 12279.

<sup>4</sup> GC section 6252(e).

This bill would make express legislative findings and declarations that this act furthers the right of public access to the writings of local public officials and local agencies by requiring that public agencies preserve for at least two years every public record that is transmitted by electronic mail.

### **Implementation Considerations**

This bill would require the department to substantially increase data retention beginning January 1, 2020, requiring the procurement and deployment of additional storage capacity and servers. It is unclear whether the department could implement this bill by the January 1, 2020, operative date considering state project and procurement rules and time required to install and deploy new hardware.

### **Legislative History**

Research of California legislation found no legislation similar to the provisions of this bill.

### **Program Background**

Information received, generated, and maintained by the FTB is generally considered confidential unless specifically made public by statute. The FTB has stringent departmental policies and procedures regarding privacy and disclosure. All employees receive training annually about ensuring the confidentiality of taxpayer information and are given updated procedures on a regular basis. Any violation of these policies and procedures is subject to disciplinary action, punishable by law, or both.

The CPRA provides access to public information the FTB maintains unless the records are exempt from disclosure by law. This may include written or electronic information.

The FTB is exempt from disclosing information, such as:

- Personnel, medical, or similar files for FTB employees.
- Tests questions and scoring keys for employment exams.
- Preliminary drafts of documents not retained by the department.
- Records pertaining to pending litigation.

### **Other States' Information**

The states surveyed include *Florida, Illinois, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, and New York*. These states were selected due to their similarities to California's economy, business entity types, and tax laws.

All of the states surveyed have public record laws similar to the CPRA providing for retention of public records; however, none of the state laws surveyed provide a specified retention period for all emails similar to the one that would be created by this bill.

**Fiscal Impact**

Staff estimates a cost of approximately \$150,000 for 2020-2021 and \$38,000 for 2021-2022 for the acquisition of additional storage.

**Economic Impact**

Revenue Estimate

Estimated Revenue Impact of AB 1184  
Assumed Enactment after June 30, 2019.

This bill would not impact state income or franchise tax revenue.

This analysis does not account for changes in employment, personal income, or gross state product that could result from this bill or for the net final payment method of accrual.

**Appointments**

None.

**Votes**

Location	Date	Yes Votes	No Votes
Concurrence	September 10, 2019	63	11
Senate Floor	September 9, 2019	32	4
Assembly Floor	May 28, 2019	59	8

**Legislative Staff Contact**

Contact	Work
Julie Lee Acting Agency Secretary	(916) 651-9011
Christina Spagnoli Deputy Secretary, Legislation	(916) 651-9373
Selvi Stanislaus Executive Officer, FTB	(916) 845-4543
Jahna Carlson Asst. Legislative Director, FTB	(916) 845-5386