

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

FRANCHISE TAX BOARD

FRANCHISE TAX BOARD MEETING

MONDAY, JUNE 22, 2026,

at 10:31 a.m.

MAY LEE STATE OFFICE COMPLEX

651 BANNON STREET

SACRAMENTO, CA 95827

Reported by: Brandon Iorlano, CER-4221
iDepo Reporters
898 North Pacific Coast Highway
Suite 475
El Segundo, California 90245

INDEX

ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
Item 1	Approval of Minutes for April 6, 2026 Board Meeting	6
Item 2	2026 Filing Season Update	7
Item 3	Community Related Tax Preference Items	35
Item 4	Collections Overview	58
Item 5	Legislative Update	93
Item 6	Administrative Matters	81
Item 7	Executive Officer's Time	105
Item 8	Board Members' Time	108
	Adjournment	115
	Reporter's Certificate	116

1 APPEARANCES:

2 Malia Cohen - Chair Controller

3 Sally J. Lieber - Chair, BOE

4 Michele Perrault - Chief Deputy Director, Policy, DOF

5 Hasib Emran - Deputy Controller, Taxation

6 Selvi Stanislaus - Executive Officer

7 Shane Hofeling - Chief Counsel

8 Erin Dendorfer - Deputy Chief Counsel

9 Cristina Rubalcava - Board Liaison

10 Matt Feaster

11 Ozra Nayebkhil

12 Daniel Tahara

13 Jaclyn Zumaeta

14 Jame Eiserman

15 Javone Tavares

16 Erica Weatherspoon

17 Wendy Cramer

18 Michael Banuelos

19 Abel Escobar

20 Rosita Mindermann

21 Christine Grab

22 Joyce Cheng

23

24

25

Monday, June 22, 2026

10:31 a.m.

-oOo-

CHAIR COHEN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. It is 10:31, exactly on Monday, June 22nd. I want to welcome everyone to the regularly scheduled Franchise Tax Board meeting. This is the scheduled time for the meeting, and I'd appreciate it if the board liaison would please call the role to determine if a quorum is present.

MS. RUBALCAVA: Member Lieber?

MS. LIEBER: Here.

MS. RUBALCAVA: Member Perrault?

MS. PERRAULT: Here.

MS. RUBALCAVA: Chair Controller Malia Cohen?

CHAIR COHEN: Present.

All right. That's awesome. We're all here. Congratulations to all of us. All right. Ladies and gentlemen, if you are physically able, please rise with me. We're going to go and say the pledge of allegiance. Please rise. Put your right hand over your heart and pledge.

(Whereupon, the pledge of

1 allegiance was recited by those
2 present.)

3 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Good morning
4 again, ladies and gentlemen. As I mentioned, this is
5 the Franchise Tax Board's meeting. The public has
6 the right to comment on each and every agenda item.
7 If there are any members of the public wishing to
8 speak on an item, I ask that you please come forward
9 right here. And when the item is called, you will
10 have three minutes to address the address this body,
11 the Board. And for today's Board meeting, members of
12 the public who wish to comment via teleconference, I
13 ask that you call 844-767-5651, and then enter the
14 access code -- it's pretty long so get ready. Here
15 is the access code, 4868807. That's access code
16 4868807. Please be aware that there is a short delay
17 bet the web live stream and the live event. If there
18 are any members of the public wishing to speak on any
19 item, and you're using a translator or a translator
20 service, you will have six minutes to address this
21 body. All speakers will be asked to identify
22 yourself for the record. So now we're going to move
23 on to agenda Item Number 1.

24 Madame secretary, good morning to you.
25 Could you please call the first agenda item?

1 MS. RUBALCAVA: Good morning. The first
2 agenda item, members, is the approval of minutes. We
3 have the minutes from the April 6, 2026, Tax Board
4 meeting.

5 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
6 much.

7 Members, do you have any comments or
8 questions? All right. Seeing none on my right,
9 seeing none on my left. Okay. Is there any member
10 of the public that'd like to comment or speak on this
11 item in person or on the teleconference line? All
12 right. I see no one in the chamber --

13 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members --

14 CHAIR COHEN: Please go ahead, Operator.

15 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
16 on the phone lines, if you would like to place
17 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a
18 reminder, you may press 1 and 0 at this time.

19 No members of the public are queueing up
20 at this time. Please continue.

21 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
22 much.

23 Colleagues, is there a motion for
24 approval of the minutes?

25 MS. PERRAULT: So moved.

1 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Motion made by
2 Member Perrault.

3 Is there a second?

4 MS. LIEBER: Seconded.

5 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you so
6 much. I think we could take this with that
7 objection. Same house, same call. All right.
8 Unanimously approved.

9 All right. Madame secretary, please call
10 the next agenda item, number two.

11 MS. RUBALCAVA: Next, we have
12 Agenda Item 2. It's the 2026 Filing Season Update
13 presented by Matt Feaster and Ozra Nayebkhil. This
14 is an informational item.

15 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
16 much. We appreciate you. Please come on up to the
17 podium, and the floor is yours. Good morning.

18 MR. FEASTER: Good morning Chair
19 Controller and Board Members. My name is
20 Matt Feaster. I'm from the Processing Services
21 Bureau in the filing division. And today I'm here
22 with Ozra Nayebkhil from the Business Entity
23 Collection Bureau and the accounts receivable
24 management division. We are excited to share
25 information with you today about our 2026 filing

1 season at Franchise Tax Board.

2 Unlike in prior years, this year, there
3 were no major catastrophic events that required
4 moving our filing due dates from their normal
5 schedule. This was very helpful for FTB and
6 California taxpayers. Everyone knew what to expect,
7 and could plan accordingly. I'm sure that as
8 Californians, we can all agree that a return to this
9 more familiar schedule was a positive thing.

10 And FTB planning for a successful filing
11 season involves multiple teams across the enterprise.
12 We know that success during the filing season helps
13 us set the stage for success throughout the rest of
14 the year. We communicate and coordinate across the
15 organization to ensure a smooth filing experience for
16 our stakeholders. We are pleased to report that our
17 extensive coordination and planning resulted in a
18 very successful April 15th. FTB consistently
19 prioritizes customer service during the filing
20 season.

21 To provide an extra level of service,
22 this year we implemented the following enhancements.
23 Our customer service phone line and live chat service
24 were extended one additional hour until 6:00 p.m.,
25 from April 1st through April 15th. Our tax

1 practitioner hotline was also open one additional
2 hour until 6:00 p.m., from March 2nd through
3 March 16th and again on April 1st through the 15th.
4 The service channels were also available on the
5 March 31st holiday for Farmworker Day and Saturday,
6 April 11th, from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. And of
7 course, our online self-service options remained
8 available 24 hours a day, seven days a week.
9 Additionally, FTB provides detailed filing
10 instructions, helpful information on its website, and
11 various self-service tools, including MyFTB and
12 online payment options.

13 And before I discuss this further, I'd
14 just like to level set that all of the statistics and
15 numbers that you will hear in the rest of this
16 presentation are for January through May of this
17 year. Our efforts to help our customers self-serve
18 continue to produce results, with taxpayers visiting
19 our website over 20 million times. They accessed our
20 web pay application 3.2 million times. Our Check
21 Your Refund app had 6.6 million views. And our MyFTB
22 application was accessed 3.7 million times. We are
23 happy to report that all of these numbers were up
24 from the same period last year. We continue to look
25 for ways to encourage using our self-service options

1 and will maintain this as a focus for the 2027 tax
2 filing season.

3 Next I'd like to cover some return and
4 payment filing highlights. FTB continued to see an
5 increased use of our electronic filing options as
6 taxpayers filed by the April due date. 16.8 million
7 personal income tax returns were filed, 96% of which
8 were filed electronically, a slight increase over
9 last year. In addition to filed tax returns,
10 12.8 million refunds were issued, 88% by direct
11 deposit. This is up 4% from last year. And nearly
12 6.2 million personal income tax payments were
13 received. 75% were received electronically, compared
14 to 71% last year.

15 Next I'll share some of our customer
16 service statistics. So far this year, our customer
17 service contact center has taken over 387,000 calls
18 at a 42% level of access. They have also answered
19 over 93,000 live chats at a 60% level of access. The
20 average wait time for our phone agents was about
21 14 minutes, while the average wait time to live chat
22 with us was about 16 minutes. We recognize that
23 during the busiest times of the year, on occasion,
24 taxpayers may find it difficult to connect with us
25 and a contact center agent. This happens when

1 customer contacts received far outpaced funded
2 staffing levels. Because FTB has a finite number of
3 budgeted resources dedicated to resolving taxpayer
4 contacts, we continue to enhance other service
5 offerings to allow taxpayers and their
6 representatives to resolve their issue without FTB
7 assistance.

8 Some of our recent self-services include
9 smart routing of calls and correspondence. The
10 service integrates our phone systems with our case
11 management application to ensure that calls and
12 written correspondence reach the right destination
13 the first time, minimizing the need for transfers.
14 Additionally we have implemented a notice based
15 response service. Many of our notices now include
16 options for taxpayers and their representatives to
17 respond online. These online services reduce
18 processing time by eliminating FTB paper handling
19 processes. Finally, taxpayers can submit a number of
20 applications online, including offer and compromise,
21 innocent joint filer, and applications for tax exempt
22 status. In addition, taxpayers can request
23 information about their accounts, including personal
24 income tax and business entity tax computations,
25 revivor requests, and bulk sales certificates. FTB

1 continues to market these services via tax news
2 articles and in person presentations to groups, such
3 as escrow associations, the California Society of
4 Enrolled Agents, and CalCPA.

5 In addition to self-service, FTB
6 continues to publish new how to videos to make it
7 easier for taxpayers and their representatives to
8 meet their filing obligations and make payments
9 easier. For example, FTB published how to videos on
10 the following topics last year: How to view your
11 client's estimated payments, how to view personal
12 income tax estimated payments through MyFTB, and how
13 to view business entity estimated tax payments
14 through MyFTB. As you can see, FTB is using a
15 multipoint strategy to try and reduce the number of
16 contacts we received regarding issues which can be
17 resolved through self-service. We will continue to
18 market these services to encourage increased usage by
19 the various stakeholders we serve.

20 As I mentioned previously, the filing
21 season at FTB is truly a team undertaking. The
22 significant amount of hard work and careful planning
23 helped us to achieve our goal of a smooth filing
24 season. These efforts paid off. And I'd like to
25 share with you some feedback that we received from

1 our customers during the filing season. First is a
2 comment about one of our contact center phone agents.
3 It reads:

4 "Hi, I just spoke with Tamara
5 Station 1309, and wanted to say
6 that she did awesome and was able
7 to answer my questions in a timely
8 fashion. She was very professional
9 and gave me all the information
10 that I needed! Thank you."

11 Next is a comment regarding our live chat
12 service. The taxpayer shared the following:

13 "It was incredibly easy to resolve
14 the notice I received via chat
15 today. I honestly didn't expect it
16 to be that fast and simple to use,
17 but I am pleasantly surprised it
18 was. Thank you!"

19 I want to turn the presentation to my
20 partner, Ozra Nayebkhil, and she will share
21 information about our public counters, how we have
22 helped those impacted by disasters, and our programs
23 designed to aid California taxpayers.

24 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you.

25 MS. NAYEBKHIL: Thank you, Matt.

1 Good morning, Chair Controller and
2 esteemed Board Members.

3 CHAIR COHEN: Good morning. Are those
4 all your notes?

5 MS. NAYEBKHIL: Yes.

6 CHAIR COHEN: Oh, my god.

7 MS. NAYEBKHIL: I'm here prepared.

8 CHAIR COHEN: Definitely prepared. Okay.

9 MS. NAYEBKHIL: I am honored to be here
10 today to present additional updates to you today.
11 Our public counters are essential to our operations
12 to serving our customers and achieved several
13 noteworthy accomplishments this year. As of
14 April 25th, our public counters have served over
15 24,000 customers, which is similar to last year's
16 filing season. Our appointment system continues to
17 enhance the customer experience and reduce wait
18 times. We are proud to share that 93% of our public
19 counter customers have provided an approved -- have
20 provided an approval rating of 4.5 star rating out of
21 a total of 5, with frequent positive feedback on the
22 appointment scheduling experience.

23 We support our public counter goals by
24 investing in our staff and strengthening training and
25 onboarding. This filing season, we continue to have

1 new hires begin onboarding in their work areas before
2 classroom training. This gave them the opportunity
3 to shadow public counter staff and learn operations
4 and workloads early. As a result, they were better
5 prepared to transition to their primary duties after
6 training.

7 This filing season, FTB also collaborated
8 with other state agencies at Local Assistance
9 Centers, or LAC's, to aid survivors affected by
10 disasters in prior years. We have participated in
11 both LAC's and Disaster Recovery Centers, or DRC's.
12 At these centers, FTB employees offer survivors a
13 range of information such as guidance on claiming
14 disaster losses, acquiring copies of tax returns and
15 forms, or updating their addresses. For the current
16 fiscal year as of April 25th, four FTB members
17 supported 83 survivors at two LAC's. In September,
18 we served survivors from the TCU Complex fire in the
19 Sonora LAC. And in January, we served survivors from
20 the winter storm in the Hesperia LAC. Unlike last
21 year, fewer survivors were impacted.

22 In addition to the LAC activities, we
23 also assisted at three separate California State
24 Action for Facilitation on Encampments, or SAFE
25 events. The SAFE task force was a new initiative led

1 by Governor Gavin Newsom to address homelessness by
2 clearing encampments on state property, particularly
3 in the state's largest ten cities. The task force
4 brought together various state agencies, including
5 Emergency Management, Health and Human Services, and
6 Public Safety, to coordinate efforts with local
7 governments in providing shelter, social services,
8 and long-term solutions with poor individuals
9 experiencing homelessness. At these SAFE events, the
10 Franchise Tax Board staff assisted with changing
11 mailing addresses, receiving copies of tax returns,
12 and answering personal income tax account questions,
13 and answering general questions about the California
14 Earned Income Tax Credit.

15 The Franchise Tax Board continued its
16 participation in the Voluntary Income Tax Assistance,
17 or VITA program, which offers free and state federal
18 tax return preparation to taxpayers in their local
19 communities. This year, 1,368 volunteers and site
20 coordinators were trained, along with an additional
21 107 FTB certified volunteers. 26 of these volunteers
22 were first-time volunteers. The FTB VITA team
23 provides training to both FTB volunteers and non-FTB
24 volunteers. There are several in-person VITA events
25 throughout California facilitated by community

1 partners and local nonprofits. FTB VITA team and the
2 FTB volunteers participated in 17 in-person events.
3 And as of April 16th, FTB VITA volunteers prepared
4 approximately 5,176 federal and state tax returns.

5 Moving to our next program, CalFile.
6 CalFile is another important application that
7 provides a free filing option for California tax
8 returns. As of April 29th, CalFile has received
9 65,913 returns. As part of our education outreach
10 efforts, we continue to include marketing in the tax
11 booklets to promote this free tool. We also expanded
12 our advertising through social media. During tax
13 season we highlighted the tool in media interviews
14 and outreach discussions. In addition, we promoted
15 the tool on flyers distributed across college
16 campuses and at food bank locations.

17 We also have programs benefiting small
18 business owners. Here at the Franchise Tax Board, we
19 understand how important it is to have an informative
20 and effective education outreach program to small
21 business owners. Our education outreach team and our
22 small business liaison have taken this responsibility
23 seriously and have worked tirelessly to interact with
24 and inform small business owners about their filing
25 requirements. This has been accomplished by

1 attending and presenting in person and virtually at
2 small business events throughout the state.
3 Presenting this information clearly has helped
4 countless small business owners understand their
5 income tax filings and to stay current and up to date
6 with them. To date, the small business liaison
7 participated in 22 events and have helped
8 approximately 15,000 attendees in fiscal year 25/26.

9 As FTB celebrates the completion of
10 another very successful filing season, we are proud
11 to look back at all that we have accomplished, and we
12 have immense gratitude for the opportunity to serve
13 our taxpayers and our customers. The collaborative
14 partnership between the filing and accounts
15 receivable management divisions' contact centers
16 ensures the best service and utmost support to
17 California's taxpayers. We sincerely appreciate our
18 dedicated team members who make this possible, and we
19 look forward to continuing these efforts.

20 Thank you for allowing us time to present
21 our filing season achievements that benefit
22 California taxpayers and highlight our dedicated
23 employees' efforts. We truly value your ongoing
24 support and are happy to answer any questions.

25 CHAIR COHEN: All right, great. Thank

1 you very much. Let's check in with the colleagues.

2 Any questions on this end?

3 MS. PERRAULT: Just a comment, actually.
4 I just -- I noticed that the level of access for
5 phone calls versus live chats have sort of flipped in
6 percentage. It's just interesting that I think
7 people are starting to get more comfortable maybe
8 using live chats. Are we kind of continuing to sort
9 of see that trend of more folks using the live chat
10 versus waiting for a live person?

11 MR. FEASTER: Thank you for the question.
12 It's interesting that you would ask that, because
13 actually, what we're seeing is an increase in live
14 chat and an increase in phone calls. So while live
15 chat numbers are up, our phone call numbers continue
16 to grow, actually, at a pace that even outpaces the
17 number of additional live chats that we're receiving.
18 Which is why you heard me talk in my presentation a
19 lot about our self-service options and the things
20 that we're trying to do to market those, to try to
21 allow folks to take advantage of those things where
22 they can. Because we -- you know, the calls continue
23 to go up, along with the chats. So a great question.

24 CHAIR COHEN: All right, thank you.

25 Yes?

1 MS. LIEBER: Thank you. I had a question
2 on the phone calls and the live chats. What does
3 the -- what does the percentage mean that's level of
4 access?

5 MR. FEASTER: Sure, great question. So
6 that's basically a math problem that focuses on the
7 number of calls that we receive versus the number of
8 calls that we can actually answer.

9 MS. LIEBER: Okay. And that's -- we're
10 funded to perform the level of service that's
11 represented here. But say with the phone calls, it's
12 42% of the overall demand. So where do the other 58%
13 of the folks go? Do they just not get the help?

14 MR. FEASTER: Sure, great question. It's
15 not that they don't get help. There are times where
16 we do have to, what we call, deflect calls. Which
17 means we're actually not able to even accept them
18 into our queue, because the volumes are just so high
19 that there's just not going to be enough agents to be
20 able to answer those questions. So that allows folks
21 at some points to -- after they've called, they may
22 go to live chat, as well, to try and resolve their
23 case that way. All of the self-services that we
24 offer, some people will move back to our website and
25 try to solve the problem themselves. So there's a

1 number of things that happen there. Other people
2 will, you know, call back at a different time. And
3 that may be part of why there's a number of phone
4 calls that are still increasing. Because people are
5 calling multiple times, you know, if they're not able
6 to wait on hold or they're not able to get through
7 and that type of thing. But we do try to serve all
8 of those folks, but it just may look different than a
9 one-on-one phone call.

10 MS. LIEBER: Okay. And then is the live
11 chat -- what hours is that available?

12 MR. FEASTER: I believe that's available
13 from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., as I -- let me just
14 check. Yeah, so during the during the peak periods,
15 we did extend that one additional hour until
16 6:00 p.m. But that is normally available 8:00 a.m.
17 to 5:00 p.m.

18 MS. LIEBER: Okay. And if we wanted to
19 increase that, it would be a budget ask, to have
20 agents being available, say from 8:00 to 8:00 or
21 something like that.

22 MR. FEASTER: Yes.

23 MS. LIEBER: Okay. Thank you.

24 CHAIR COHEN: All right. A couple
25 questions, similarly and along the same line. If

1 it's duplicated, I apologize.

2 First, I do want to talk about the phone
3 level of access. As you stated, it's at 42%. So
4 that means about six in ten callers who attempted to
5 reach a live agent and couldn't get through. And so
6 those that can't get through, what do they
7 experience? They just get told to call back? They
8 leave their numbers, and you automatically call back?
9 Could you refresh my memory?

10 MR. FEASTER: Sure, great question. So
11 both things happen; right? There are times where we
12 have to, what we call, deflect phone calls, which
13 would be where they're not able to get through. They
14 would receive a message that says that we're unable
15 to accept their call at this time because of call
16 volumes. The other thing is that we do have a
17 virtual hold, which is where they can go in and leave
18 their callback information. And we do call those
19 back, you know before the end of that day. So both
20 things are true, as you mentioned.

21 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. And then what was
22 the level of access in the prior filing season? And
23 I really want to know if we are improving, or is our
24 response rate deteriorating? And then also, the
25 final question is how are we -- what's FTB's goal to

1 increase the rate?

2 MR. FEASTER: Sure. So to your first
3 question about our level of accesses last year, they
4 were slightly higher last year. Last year during the
5 same period, our level of access on the phones was
6 47%, and our level of access on the chats was 67%.
7 So they were down a little bit this year. I would
8 point out that during this year, we received during
9 the same period of time last year -- this year we
10 received an additional 261,000 phone calls over last
11 year and an additional 67,000 live chats. So the
12 volumes were significantly higher. Which, when you
13 do the math, it drives down because, you know, if
14 we're funded and staffed similarly -- you know, if
15 those volumes go up significantly, which they did,
16 it's just the function of the math. It just drives
17 that number down a little bit.

18 CHAIR COHEN: So you're arguing that they
19 decrease, although slight, I think 5%, is due to an
20 increase someplace else?

21 MR. FEASTER: It's just the additional
22 phone calls. Because of that level of access, it's
23 just a math equation, how many calls could we answer
24 versus how many received. So when 261,000 additional
25 calls come in, even if we take more calls, it still

1 drives that level of access down.

2 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. And I'm wondering if
3 we're able to correlate -- you know, we did kind of
4 like a marketing campaign. Remember there's a --
5 what are those things called? Billboards. I can't
6 recall what the content was on the billboard. I
7 think -- I'm not sure if it was for hiring. But
8 either way, the way I see it is, is that talking
9 about and having a visual reminder about the
10 Franchise Tax Board could be at the forefront of
11 people's minds. I'm just wondering if there's a way
12 to do a deep dive on the data and/or even survey
13 folks when they are calling. Their satisfaction, how
14 do they know about this? Is this the first time
15 they've called? Would they use this again? Would
16 they recommend us to a friend and family. Just, I
17 don't know we -- I don't think we've ever done that,
18 a temperature read on the service level that we're
19 providing, particularly as it relates to the chat and
20 the call.

21 MR. FEASTER: Yeah, we -- that's
22 certainly -- we could certainly take back and do a
23 deep dive into some of those things. I know that we
24 do have some survey options, but I'm not personally
25 super familiar with them. So that would be something

1 that we could take back.

2 CHAIR COHEN: Maybe next year when you
3 come back and present, I'd love to hear what the
4 survey actually says. Because that -- I want to know
5 what the customers are saying. Now, do we have a
6 vendor that is staffing this or consulting on this
7 particular part of the business?

8 MR. FEASTER: So --

9 CHAIR COHEN: Or is it all internally
10 managed?

11 MR. FEASTER: So the workload management
12 itself is done internally. You know, we are engaging
13 in a in a in a project to modernize our contact
14 center platform, and that will be in conjunction with
15 a vendor. But right now, that's just in its infancy
16 stages of trying to put that all together. So the
17 workload management that we do, you know, to try and
18 mitigate the call volumes and everything is all done
19 internally.

20 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. Here's a big idea;
21 right? Take it or leave it. It's free.

22 MR. FEASTER: We're ready.

23 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. I'm thinking, we
24 have a relationship with Sac State. We have a
25 relationship with USC. I think there's a Sacramento

1 campus here. Maybe getting the graduate students
2 creating a capstone project or a master's thesis
3 level project to begin to do a dive in on the data.
4 Just find out exactly what it's -- what it could tell
5 us, what it's not telling us, what we're missing.
6 Because I'd imagine that the FTB employees are
7 probably pretty stretched thin, but we would be not
8 only be serving the community, but it would also get
9 a real tangible end product that could inform the way
10 we do our business. There's enough work for a
11 semester. There's enough data. I mean, if we were
12 to look even for the last five years or have it go
13 back ten years, but we would be able to see our
14 growth and be able to predict where we could go into
15 the future. Just an idea, we could further scope it
16 out. But I think that that sounds like a really good
17 summer internship program and/or capstone project for
18 graduate level student. FTB is rich with so much
19 information and data that we could get some data
20 mining, some data -- future budding data analysts,
21 and -- or who knows, future state employees --
22 interested in this project. I'm interested in the
23 information because I think that that will inform the
24 direction that we go in. And it supports us when we
25 go to the legislature asking for BCP's, asking for

1 more funding, saying, "Hey, this is this is what
2 we're doing. This is what our data shows. If you
3 make a sizable investment in our operations, we will
4 be able to reach X number of people faster, more
5 efficiently." So I just want to make sure that we
6 are always bettering our best.

7 Another question I have has to do with
8 the SAFE program. The SAFE program assisted 57
9 people experiencing homelessness across the three
10 events that you mentioned. But when we use the term
11 assisted, does that mean that the individuals have
12 filed complete returns or that they're just simply
13 receiving information and referrals? I'm just
14 looking for clarification on how we're defining the
15 term assisted. Thanks.

16 MS. NAYEBKHIL: Good question. So the
17 services that we provided were similar to what we
18 provide during LAC's and DRC's, and that is being
19 information -- being available to provide information
20 if they have questions about filing returns, or maybe
21 getting a copy of a tax return, or maybe establishing
22 a mailing address. So we're really there to provide
23 information.

24 CHAIR COHEN: Okay, so -- got it. So
25 assisted in the loose definition of just providing

1 assistance or just helping people put their lives
2 back together.

3 MS. NAYEBKHIL: Correct. So in terms of
4 the same -- what we do with -- during disasters for
5 LAC's or DRC's is just information -- available to
6 provide information.

7 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
8 much.

9 MS. NAYEBKHIL: You're welcome.

10 CHAIR COHEN: Did you have other follow
11 up?

12 MS. LIEBER: I do.

13 CHAIR COHEN: Okay.

14 MS. LIEBER: I was wondering. On the
15 public counters, how many public counters do we have
16 currently?

17 MS. NAYEBKHIL: Good question. So for
18 our public counters, we are in Oakland, Sacramento,
19 San Diego, Santa Ana, and Los Angeles.

20 MS. LIEBER: Okay. And I guess this is
21 for our executive officer. Are we anticipating
22 increased funding for the access? Are we going to be
23 making a request at some point for that?

24 MS. STANISLAUS: At this point, no. I'm
25 looking at finance, but maybe in the future.

1 MS. LIEBER: Okay. If there are ways
2 that we can help in advocating for that, it sounds
3 like there's a lot of interest on this Board.

4 And then I had a question about the SAFE
5 program also. I know that when people are -- it's
6 day of being swept. And people are losing their safe
7 place, it's awfully hard to think about the outreach.
8 And people are rushing to save their prescriptions,
9 and their pets, and other things. And so do we have,
10 in terms of the EITC, specific outreach for
11 homelessness service providers? I think that might
12 come under some of the major groups that we have.
13 But is anyone looking at that as a specific focus?

14 MS. NAYEBKHIL: Good question. So at
15 these SAFE events, we were available to provide
16 questions about the different credits, such as the
17 Earned Income Tax Credit. But in terms of reaching
18 that specific sector of homelessness, we outreach for
19 everyone equally. And we do that have a presentation
20 later on this morning that will provide more
21 information about our education outreach efforts for
22 the EITC credit.

23 MS. LIEBER: Okay. Thank you.

24 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. Before we move on, I
25 just want to let Member Perrault talk.

1 MS. PERRAULT: I just didn't want -- I
2 wasn't sure if you were going to move on, so I didn't
3 want to -- didn't mean to interrupt.

4 I guess I have a good question, and I
5 guess it's a follow up. So, you know, I think this
6 is good conversation around access rates. And, you
7 know, I understand with volumes overall going up,
8 what it does to the percentage. It makes sense when
9 your resources stay the same. What's your current
10 vacancy rate in your call center?

11 MR. FEASTER: You know that's a great
12 question. I don't have that number off the top of my
13 head, but we can certainly get that and get back to
14 you.

15 MS. PERRAULT: Yeah.

16 MR. FEASTER: I can share that the
17 contact centers have gone to a four-times-a-year
18 hiring model, so that they're constantly trying to
19 replenish those folks who are moving on from those
20 roles. So I know that, you know, as an enterprise,
21 you know, we are doing everything we can to try and
22 mitigate the vacancy rates. But yeah, I don't have
23 the actual number.

24 MS. PERRAULT: And I get it. Call
25 centers have -- typically have high turnover rates.

1 They have high vacancy rates. And so, you know, as
2 we talk about this conversation, and I think this is
3 a good sort of interplay between with the comments
4 the Chair made and then the question about resources
5 from my other fellow Board Member. Which is, it may
6 not necessarily be the result of needing more actual
7 resources for positions, because you may -- but it
8 may be a conversation around how do you market for
9 retention and filling what you already have. So I
10 just -- the reason I ask is, my guess was that that
11 was probably your response. We see this across all
12 state agencies that hold call centers. You guys have
13 a fairly large one. But I'm just kind of curious
14 about those sort of those things. So thank you for
15 letting me.

16 MR. FEASTER: Thank you.

17 CHAIR COHEN: No problem. I actually
18 just wanted just to acknowledge some other numbers.
19 Just the men and women of the Franchise Tax Board
20 that have been trained to volunteer with the data
21 center -- the VITA center. I think the team has
22 accomplished a tremendous amount. This body is very
23 proud of them. Like you said in the presentation,
24 nearly 17 million personal income tax returns
25 processed. 12 and a half million refunds issued, 88%

1 of them by direct deposit. I mean, this is just
2 getting better and better. This is really exciting.

3 I want to also recognize the 107
4 certified FTB staff and the 1,368 trained volunteers
5 who give their time to VITA centers. This is
6 something that people are doing above and beyond. I
7 had a chance to go to several VITA centers, as I do
8 during the tax season. And first of all, the tacos
9 draw me in. I'm not going to lie, when they have
10 Tacos and Taxes, I'm there. But we have a really
11 good time. And what you see, when you when you talk
12 to the people that are in line, you see a lot of
13 seniors, in particular, that have a lot of questions,
14 that are unsure about technology, and are excited and
15 welcome to help. So I just want to affirm all of the
16 volunteers what they are doing and hopefully will
17 continue to do, because it is -- maybe seems
18 thankless, but we are recognizing and thanking you.
19 The volunteers prepared over 5,000 federal and state
20 returns for people who needed help, and that is just
21 tremendous. Would love to see, of course, more
22 volunteers.

23 And again, I want to just put a capstone
24 on the two areas that I want to flag, where I believe
25 that the data calls for more of a conversation. It's

1 just our phone level of access came in at 42% this
2 season, which means that there's a significant amount
3 of taxpayers who reached out for help, but didn't get
4 through, or were lost or got discouraged, or called
5 several times. I don't know. But if we could track
6 these people and track the story, it would help us
7 get better. We think of ourselves as athletes. You
8 guys have been watching the World Cup and the soccer?
9 I mean, these are top level athletes that watch the
10 film and the footage, and they're constantly taking
11 this information in, and processing it, and producing
12 it to increase their efficiency. And that's exactly
13 the direction that I think we should be going in.

14 I also want to talk about our CalFile
15 program. It's a free direct file option. I think
16 that we are part of a small class of states that
17 offer this. I am proud of it. When we travel and we
18 listen to a lot of our counterparts across the state,
19 as well as in Washington, DC, they're commending us
20 for participating in this program. And we're still
21 reaching a very small share of total filers. I want
22 to continue to push to move that. I want to raise --
23 I raised these two points not to diminish any of the
24 work that we've accomplished, but just so that staff
25 understand that we understand the complexity of the

1 nature of their work and that we are partners in
2 this. And I look forward to the FTB working with the
3 leadership to address both of these opportunities,
4 and so that next year when you present, you're going
5 to be like, "oh, my god. We were at 42%, and now
6 we're at 52%," so that we just get better and
7 better. And that's a real feel-good moment.

8 All right. That's it. That's all I
9 have. Let's continue moving forward. I appreciate
10 your presentation and your work. Thank you.

11 MR. FEASTER: Thank you.

12 MS. NAYEBKHIL: Thank you.

13 CHAIR COHEN: All right. So we're going
14 to go on to public comment. There was a lot of
15 information shared. Any member of the public that
16 would like to comment on this in the chamber?

17 All right. Seeing not one person
18 flinching to come up to the podium. Let's check
19 online.

20 Operator, anyone online?

21 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
22 on the phone lines, if you would like to place
23 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a
24 reminder, you may press 1 and 0 at this time.

25 No members of the public are queueing up

1 at this time. Please continue.

2 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you so
3 much. We are going to continue to Item Number 3.

4 Ms. Rubalcava, please call the item.

5 MS. RUBALCAVA: Agenda Item 3 is the
6 Community Related Tax Preference Items presented by
7 Dan Tahara, Jame Eiserman, and Jackie Zumaeta. This
8 is an informational item.

9 CHAIR COHEN: All right, informational
10 item. Hello team. All right. Take it away.

11 MR. TAHARA: Good morning, Chair
12 Controller and esteemed Members of the Board. My
13 name is Daniel Tahara, and I'm the director of the
14 Public Affairs Office in the Administrative Services
15 Division. I'm joined by Jacquelyn Zumaeta from the
16 Legal Division and Jame Eiserman from our Finance and
17 Executive Services Division. Today, we'll be
18 discussing community related tax preference items.

19 I'll begin with an update on our
20 marketing and outreach efforts aimed at increasing
21 the number of returns claiming the California Earned
22 Income Tax Credit, or CalEITC, Young Child Tax
23 Credit, YCTC, and the Foster Youth Tax Credit, FYTC.
24 These valuable credits provide a financial boost for
25 low-income working individuals and can increase their

1 refund by hundreds or even thousands of dollars,
2 depending on their income and family size.

3 CalEITC is a refund tax credit that puts
4 money back into the pockets of California's working
5 families and individuals, earning up to \$32,900 for
6 the 2025 tax year. The maximum credit for tax year
7 2025 is \$3,576. And this year we received 2.9
8 million CalEITC returns, the same number of returns
9 that were filed at this time last year. The total
10 dollar amount of payments issued this year increased
11 to 873 million, compared to 849 million last year.
12 And the average CalEITC amount also increased to \$302
13 this year, up from \$289 last year.

14 Now, it's important to note that due to
15 increases of minimum wage, anyone that's making
16 minimum wage and working full-time no longer
17 qualifies for CalEITC as they exceed the income
18 limit. Credit is designed to support economic
19 stability and workforce participation among lower
20 income workers. It was intended to supplement
21 earnings rather than encourage long term dependency,
22 while gradually phasing out as a taxpayer's income
23 increases.

24 Taxpayers who qualify for CalEITC and had
25 a child under the age of six at the end of the tax

1 year may be eligible for the Young Child Tax Credit,
2 up to \$1,189. This year we received 346,000 YCTC
3 returns, compared to 357,000 last year, a decrease of
4 about 11,000 returns. Despite that, the total dollar
5 amount of credits increased to 383 million, up from
6 382 million last year. And the average YCTC payment
7 increased from \$1,068 to \$1,104.

8 Individuals who qualified for CalEITC and
9 were part of the California foster care system may
10 also be eligible for the Foster Youth Tax Credit, up
11 to \$1,189. This year, we received 4,500 FYTC
12 returns, down from 5,100 last year, a decrease of
13 about 600 returns. The total dollar amount of
14 credits allowed dropped to 5.1 million this year,
15 compared to 5.6 million last year. However, the
16 average FYTC payment increased from \$1,104 to \$1,135.

17 And I'd like to extend a special thank
18 you to Chair Controller Cohen and her staff for their
19 involvement in the development and planning of our
20 marketing and outreach efforts this year. We
21 appreciate their helpful feedback and guidance on
22 where and how we should focus our efforts. In
23 addition to the discussions with Chair Controller
24 Cohen's team, we also coordinated with former FTB
25 Board Member and BOE Chair Ted Gaines' staff and met

1 with interested community partners.

2 Now, I'm happy to share the marketing and
3 outreach that was implemented based on these
4 discussions. Messaging regarding these three credits
5 was included in two news releases issued in January
6 and April, with another release planned for October
7 to remind taxpayers filing on extension. Information
8 about these credits was also promoted in multiple
9 social media posts and media interviews in both
10 English and Spanish throughout the filing season. We
11 participated in monthly CalEITC grantee meetings to
12 spread CalEITC messaging through trusted
13 organizations. Monthly grantee meetings provide a
14 forum for program updates, administrative
15 announcements, and partner questions. FTB
16 participates by presenting CalEITC updates and
17 responding to filing season and program related
18 questions. Through these partnerships and community
19 based organizations, close to 160,000 posters and
20 flyers were distributed statewide to promote the
21 credit and encourage filing.

22 We also conducted outreach at college
23 resource fairs to help build trusts with students and
24 provide information regarding tax credits to students
25 who may qualify for income-based assistance programs.

1 Our Filing Division sent 332,000 outreach letters in
2 mid-February to taxpayers who may be eligible for
3 CalEITC, but did not file a tax return in a recent
4 tax year. The letters informed potentially eligible
5 taxpayers about CalEITC money they can receive and
6 provides them with information on how they can get
7 their tax returns prepared and filed for free, both
8 in person and online. And as of April 30, 2026, FTB
9 has received 60,000 tax returns claiming these
10 valuable credits from taxpayers who received these
11 letters.

12 From March 13th to April 15, 2026, FTB
13 ran a statewide radio and digital audio campaign in
14 English and Spanish to promote awareness of the tax
15 credits. The campaign used a media mix consisting of
16 radio, digital advertising, streaming, and podcasts
17 to reach several priority populations, including
18 non-English speakers, low-income individuals, parents
19 of young children, former Foster youth, urban rural
20 communities, and people with disabilities. The
21 campaign was designed to reach target audiences
22 across major metropolitan areas throughout California
23 including Los Angeles, San Diego, the Bay Area, as
24 well as statewide coverage. The ad campaign cost a
25 \$109,000. A total of 608 radio and digital ads were

1 run during the campaign, 251 in English and 357 in
2 Spanish. The radio ads were played more than
3 2.3 million times, and the custom campaign web page
4 received 182,000 visits. And the CalEITC calculator
5 was used 50,000 times as a result of the campaign.
6 This year 207,000 returns were received by first-time
7 CalEITC filers. In addition, there were 6,300
8 first-time YCTC returns and 1,100 first-time FYTC
9 returns filed. We're pleased with the results of our
10 marketing efforts and are excited to build on this
11 outreach next filing season.

12 Once again, I'd like to extend my
13 heartfelt thanks to the entire Board for their
14 support and guidance throughout this tax season, and
15 we look forward to working with you as we begin
16 planning next year's outreach efforts. Thank you.
17 And now we'll turn it over to Jame Eiserman.

18 MR. EISERMAN: Good morning, Chair
19 Controller and Board Members. I'm Jame Eiserman, the
20 director of the Economics and Statistical Research
21 Bureau and the Finance and Executive Services
22 Division. I'm going to provide some information on
23 Renter's Credit, Low-Income Housing Tax Credit, and
24 the Farmworker Housing Credit.

25 The Renter's Credit was designed to

1 provide support to low-income California taxpayers
2 who pay rent for their principal place of residence.
3 It is a non-refundable credit, and it provides a flat
4 amount of \$60 for taxpayers filing single or married
5 and filing a separate return and a \$120 for those
6 filing as head of household or married filing
7 jointly. Over \$1.8 million -- or sorry. Over
8 1.8 million taxpayers claimed over \$132 million in
9 credit for the 2025 tax year. In future tax years,
10 if appropriated, the credit amount will be increased
11 and will no longer be based on filing status. The
12 new amounts will be \$250 for taxpayers without
13 dependence and \$500 for taxpayers with dependents.

14 The Low-Income Housing Credit was
15 established to fund affordable housing projects for
16 residents of California and is administered by the
17 California Tax Credit Allocation Committee, CTCAC.
18 Current federal tax law allows a low-income housing
19 credit for the cost of constructing, rehabilitating,
20 or acquiring low-income housing. Current state tax
21 law generally conforms to federal law, with a few key
22 differences. The State Low-Income Housing Credit is
23 claimed over four taxable years, is limited to
24 projects located in California, rents must be
25 maintained at low-income levels for 30 years, and

1 CTCAC must have authorized a federal credit to the
2 taxpayer, or the taxpayer must qualify for federal
3 credit.

4 The Farmworker Housing Credit was
5 established to ensure dedicated funding for
6 farmworker housing projects. This program allocates
7 \$500,000 of low-income housing tax credits for
8 farmworker housing projects each year. \$231 million
9 in Low-Income Housing Credit was claimed on corporate
10 income tax returns for the 2024 tax year.

11 We thank you. Now, I would like to turn
12 the presentation over to Jacqueline Zumaeta.

13 MS. ZUMAETA: Good morning. My name is
14 Jacqueline Zumaeta, and I'm a deputy chief counsel in
15 the Legal Division. Thank you so much for the
16 opportunity to speak with you today. I'll provide a
17 brief high-level review of the deduction that
18 supports charitable giving and three important
19 California tax credits to strengthen our economy and
20 support communities across the state, the California
21 New Employment Credit, the California Competes Tax
22 Credit and the California Film and Television Tax
23 Credit.

24 Charitable deductions play a critical
25 role in strengthening communities by incentivizing

1 private investment and public good. When taxpayers
2 are able to deduct charitable contributions, they are
3 more likely to give and to give more, directly
4 supporting exempt organizations that deliver
5 essential services across the state. These
6 organizations provide food assistance, housing
7 support, workforce development, education, and
8 disaster relief, often reaching vulnerable
9 populations more quickly and efficiently than
10 government alone. The deduction effectively
11 amplifies the impact of each donated dollar, turning
12 individual generosity into scalable community
13 outcomes. For California, this means stronger safety
14 nets, reduced strain on public resources, and more
15 resilient local economies. Moving on to credits.

16 First, the California New Employment
17 Credit, or NEC, is focused on job creation in
18 targeted areas. It provides a tax credit to
19 businesses that hire full-time employees in
20 designated geographic regions, often areas with
21 higher unemployment or greater economic need. To
22 claim the credit, businesses apply for a credit
23 reservation through FTB, receive tentative approval,
24 and then claim the credit on their tax return once
25 hiring requirements are met. From a policy

1 perspective, the NEC is designed to expand access to
2 quality jobs in communities that benefit most from
3 new investment. By encouraging hiring in these
4 areas, the credit helps increase household income,
5 support local businesses, and contribute to stronger,
6 more resilient local economies.

7 Second, the California Competes Tax
8 Credit, or CCTC, is a broader economic development
9 tool. It's designed to attract and retain businesses
10 in California that are considering expanding,
11 relocating or making significant capital improvements
12 and investments. This is a competitive negotiated
13 credit. Businesses applied to the Governor's Office
14 of Business and Economic Development, or GO-Biz, and
15 are evaluated on factors such as job creation,
16 investment size, and overall economic impact. Once
17 approved, businesses claim the credit over time as
18 they meet their agreed upon hiring and investment
19 milestones. The policy goal is to ensure California
20 remains a leading destination for business growth and
21 innovation. The credit supports good paying jobs
22 that pay well, encourages long term investment, and
23 helps maintain a strong diverse economic base across
24 the state.

25 Finally, the California Film and

1 Television Tax Credit supports one of California's
2 most recognizable industries. It incentivizes film
3 and television productions to remain in California,
4 rather than relocating to other states or countries.
5 Production companies apply through the California
6 Film Commission, and once approved, they can claim
7 the credit after meeting in-state spending and
8 production requirements. This credit delivers both
9 economic and cultural value. Film and television
10 production generates significant local economic
11 activity, supporting jobs for Crew members, small
12 businesses, and vendors across many sectors.

13 In closing, while the charitable
14 deduction and each of these credits operate
15 differently, they share a common purpose, investing
16 in California's people, communities, and long term
17 economic strength. Whether by incentivizing
18 charitable giving, expanding job opportunities,
19 encouraging business investment, or supporting the
20 signature industry, these programs deliver meaningful
21 benefits across the state.

22 Thank you very much for the opportunity
23 to present to your Board today. This concludes our
24 presentation, and we would be happy to answer any
25 questions that you may have.

1 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. Great. Thank you
2 very much. I do have a question for you, Jame. You
3 could just take it from that table. You can use that
4 mic. What division department did you say you were
5 from? Statistics or something.

6 MR. EISERMAN: Yes, I'm from economics.

7 CHAIR COHEN: You said economic what?

8 MR. EISERMAN: Statistical research.

9 CHAIR COHEN: And what's your
10 background -- what's your educational background.

11 MR. EISERMAN: High school education.

12 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. All right. All
13 right. I was just curious, because I was like,
14 "Where have you been?" I've been asking all these
15 statistical questions, and I now -- now, here you
16 are. Now I know who to continue to direct my
17 questions to. All right. Jame. Noted. Okay.

18 I have questions, but let me check in
19 with my folks. Ms. Lieber, do you have -- do you
20 want to go ahead and take it?

21 MS. LIEBER: Sure. My throat is froggy,
22 but it'll probably stay that way.

23 We had a question on the EITC. The other
24 tax credits look like people are actually claiming
25 pretty close to the maximum amount. And is the very

1 low amount of the average payment just a function of
2 how many people are in the home?

3 MR. TAHARA: Thank you for that question.
4 So it appears that a number of people were at the
5 upper threshold of qualifying for the credit. And
6 then, as the minimum wage increased and the economy
7 improved, they no longer qualify. So what we're
8 seeing is that even though there's a fewer number of
9 returns being filed, the average payment has
10 increased, because as newer individuals are
11 qualifying, they're getting more money because
12 they're new entrants into the qualifications.

13 MS. LIEBER: So I don't -- I'm not sure
14 that I understand your answer. But when the maximum
15 credit for the EITC is \$3,500 in, and the average
16 amount that folks are getting is \$300. And as their
17 income goes up, the amount that they would get goes
18 down?

19 MR. TAHARA: That's correct, yes. So to
20 get the maximum credit amount, you have to have the
21 lowest amount of income available and also a high
22 number of dependents or children. So that's how you
23 get the maximum \$3,576. So if you are in the middle
24 range, maybe you only have one dependent, you're not
25 getting the full amount.

1 MS. LIEBER: Okay. And if someone is
2 currently a non-filer, because they make a low amount
3 of money that's under that threshold, how much would
4 they be likely to get for a single individual?

5 MR. TAHARA: So we actually have a
6 calculator that these -- we actually direct these
7 individuals to go to our website and actually enter
8 in their income and number of dependents. So that
9 way it gives them a calculation of how much they
10 could receive and that way it could help them make
11 the determination on whether they'd want to actually
12 file a return, if they don't have a requirement to.

13 MS. LIEBER: Okay. And it strikes me
14 that for non-filers, \$300 isn't a lot to motivate
15 someone to enter the system and make their way
16 through the system. And that's just an observation.

17 Now, who is the lead evangelist for the
18 tax credits on staff? Is it spread out in a
19 department? Or, I notice all the outreach, in terms
20 of radio and culturally specific media and et cetera,
21 who is the point person?

22 MR. TAHARA: So the main area is my team,
23 the public affairs staff. We coordinate most of the
24 efforts throughout the department. Well, we do work
25 with the entire department in our coordination. My

1 team is the point contact for the Franchise Tax
2 Board.

3 MS. LIEBER: And so is your department
4 also the one that meets with the service providers in
5 the quarterly meetings or however often those
6 meetings happen.

7 MR. TAHARA: Yes, that's correct. My
8 team does attend the monthly meetings with the
9 grantee partners and community organizations, so that
10 we can share information on any questions that
11 they're seeing within the communities or trends that
12 they might be identifying on something that maybe we
13 can change our marketing efforts to help address.

14 MS. LIEBER: Okay, super. Thank you.

15 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Ms. Perrault,
16 nothing? Okay, good. Now it's my turn. All right.

17 So I'm listening to this presentation,
18 and preparing and going over the memos. You know
19 what? I was thinking about that time when I was in
20 high school, I would get like 98% on a test. And I'd
21 be like, "Mom, Dad, 98%." And they're like, "That's
22 good. But what happened to that 2%?" And they would
23 just drill me on the 2% or the one or two questions
24 that I missed. And as a kid, I was like, "Oh,
25 they're so ungrateful, these parents. They don't

1 even know how much I studied to get here." But as an
2 adult, I recognize that we have to focus on that 2%,
3 because that is -- highlights where we are weakest.
4 And so I have some questions, and I'm going to be
5 zeroing on some areas that I think that we need to
6 work on. So again, this is a professional high level
7 conversation that we're having. We're not picking on
8 anyone. But one of the main things that I want to be
9 really direct about is that the data in front of us
10 shows that the CalEITC participation is flat. Now,
11 you guys push back when saying that there's -- what
12 did you guys say? You said that there's more higher
13 wages, which is why tax credits are flat. And I
14 think that I'm going to push back with a different
15 theory. And so just by way, I got a master's degree
16 from Carnegie Mellon in a highly quantitative focused
17 master's program, where we did nothing but data
18 analysis. So when I am just looking at this, the
19 YCYT participation, it's down by more than 11,000
20 families. And then I also noticed that the Foster
21 Youth Tax Credit is also one of the most -- foster
22 youth kids are one of the most vulnerable groups that
23 this program, that this tax credit was designed to
24 reach, and it's down 12% in a single year. And so
25 for me, that is very concerning, considering the

1 amount of money that we spent on our outreach
2 program, that is. I'm questioning the rate of return
3 on our investment, right, as anybody would when
4 they're looking at the books. And one thing I do
5 want to note is that the payments are going up, which
6 is a good thing. But not only because -- but only
7 because I believe that the same people are claiming
8 just higher or slightly higher tax credits. Does
9 that make sense? So that we are not reaching new
10 people per se, but we've got the same pool of people
11 that know about these tax credits. They're like,
12 "Oh, you guys gave me another tax credit. I'll
13 claim -- I qualify for that one too." And if my
14 assumptions are wrong, please definitely push back
15 and let me know. But so, what I'm seeing is that we
16 got the same people are claiming slightly higher tax
17 credits. And my question is, are we reaching new
18 eligible families? And I suspect that you don't have
19 the answer; right? Because we're not really tracking
20 this; right? Or are you tracking?

21 MR. TAHARA: So the only stats that we
22 have were the brand new first-time filers this year,
23 which we had 207,000 first time --

24 CHAIR COHEN: Oh, that's good.

25 MR. TAHARA: -- CalEITC filers this year.

1 CHAIR COHEN: 207,000?

2 MR. TAHARA: 207,000, yes. There were
3 6,300 for the young child tax credit and 1,100 for
4 the foster youth tax credit. Those are all
5 first-time, brand new returns that came in this year.

6 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. That's good to hear.
7 I appreciate you highlighting that number again,
8 because I just want to acknowledge that the genuine
9 effort that goes into this work. And some -- you
10 know, I think it's sexy and glamorous, but other
11 people may not be thinking it's sexy and glamorous.
12 But the outreach letters are counting, and it sounds
13 like the radio campaign, the efforts to be reaching
14 tax filers in multiple languages, are also bringing
15 and yielding some fruit. And of course, our
16 community partnership, all that work matters. But I
17 want to not lose sight about the effort and the
18 outcomes. The effort is not the same thing as the
19 outcome. And our goal is to always increase our
20 outcome. And, as you know, what doesn't get used
21 gets taken back. And the legislature will look at
22 these numbers and say, "This is very good, but." And
23 trust me when I tell you that they are looking to
24 scramble to take back any budget that is not being
25 used; am I right?

1 MS. LIEBER: It's not nailed down.

2 CHAIR COHEN: Yeah, exactly. So we don't
3 want to give our money back to them. So we need to
4 spend it. We need to spend it wisely. But we need
5 to make sure that we're documenting our efforts and
6 that we are increasing the rate of return on the
7 investment that the legislature is making in us, so
8 that our outcomes are demonstrative of our Board
9 goals. And I'm going to ask that the Franchise Tax
10 Board come back to this body in the next meeting with
11 a specific analysis of the take up gap for each of
12 these three tax credits. Again, it's the Earned
13 Income Tax Credit, it's the Foster Youth Tax Credit,
14 and then also the YCTC tax credit, as well. Speak
15 just candidly. I just want a candid assessment as to
16 why the participation is somewhat declining and I
17 want to know what a plan that you guys could come up
18 with to reverse it. So I think -- yes, Michelle
19 Perrault has a question -- a comment.

20 MS. PERRAULT: Can I just add on to the
21 Chair's kind of request? As you think about what
22 some of those data points could contain that I think
23 could be helpful for us, I think on the Cal -- or I'm
24 sorry -- on the foster youth specifically, I think it
25 would be nice. I mean foster -- part of the issue

1 with foster youth is that the audience in which is
2 impacted fluctuates by numbers every year. So I
3 think it's hard for us to just look at a number that
4 has gone down, even though we're seeing more new
5 users taking advantage of it, to understand really is
6 it going down? Or is our pool of qualified
7 individuals who can even utilize it also shrinking?
8 I think you have to have a sense of all of those data
9 points, because otherwise it only gives us part of
10 the story; right? Because if there are less foster
11 youth who are actually able to utilize that credit,
12 it might help us understand why we're seeing -- we
13 are seeing new folks come in. But if we have --
14 there's, you know, coming out of it at a greater
15 rate, it's going to -- that's going to impact that
16 that decrease. So that would -- that was my one.
17 That's one.

18 And then I think the other thing on the
19 CalEITC conversation, you know, I think you noted --
20 and it was brought up again here at the dais around
21 the minimum wage increase impact. So I think the
22 conversation -- you know, the data is good. But the
23 next logical question then becomes, is the level --
24 is the maximum income level still the correct maximum
25 income level; right? So if -- and I don't know if

1 you -- I can't remember if you said this. But when
2 we increased minimum wage, did we subsequently
3 increase that maximum income level, or did it remain
4 the same as what it was before, which was what I
5 thought. So that is a policy question. But it is a
6 policy question that should be discussed, because
7 again, if we're seeing more new individuals taking
8 advantage of it, but the level of individuals who are
9 falling off because they're hitting the max due to
10 the minimum wage, then really the question becomes,
11 does that maximum need to be addressed? Yeah. Yeah.
12 And again, that's a policy question, but I think it
13 is a -- you know, as you think about the data points,
14 that would be the next logical conversation to be
15 having around that, if we're trying to increase and
16 make sure we're not -- you know, part of the reason
17 we increase minimum wage is because we -- it's an
18 indication of goods and living -- cost of living.
19 Everything has gone up. And so it doesn't
20 necessarily now mean that those individuals shouldn't
21 still be getting a helping hand with this tax credit,
22 as well. They're still in that vulnerable space of
23 income, I would think.

24 CHAIR COHEN: Absolutely.

25 MS. PERRAULT: So anyway. Just a

1 thought.

2 CHAIR COHEN: The bar is moved up higher,
3 yeah.

4 MS. PERRAULT: Exactly. But only one of
5 the bars. That's kind of the issue there.

6 CHAIR COHEN: Which is why I think it's
7 important for us to continue. If we collect all of
8 this data and we are able to make a more compelling
9 argument when we make these policy decisions.

10 Go ahead.

11 MS. LIEBER: I just had a follow up
12 question. When the item comes back, will you be able
13 to have the 2026 increase in numbers available to
14 you? I think you mentioned that there was an
15 increase in the last -- the current filing season.

16 MR. TAHARA: Correct, yes.

17 CHAIR COHEN: I think it was 207.

18 MR. TAHARA: We'll just have an update on
19 the filing numbers for this year. Because these
20 stats were as of the end of April, so we'll have a
21 few months more of additional data.

22 MS. LIEBER: Okay.

23 MR. TAHARA: So the statistics could
24 change. The numbers could be higher when we come
25 back in September.

1 MS. LIEBER: Okay, great.

2 CHAIR COHEN: Ms. Lieber, we will work
3 with them. I understand your question and what
4 you're looking for. We will work to make sure that
5 the presentation is worthwhile.

6 MS. LIEBER: Thank you.

7 CHAIR COHEN: My pleasure. One more
8 thing. The \$109,000 ad campaign and the 332,000
9 outreach letters generated 60,000 new returns, which
10 is an 18% response rate. I think the Board should
11 ask what shares -- what share of those responses were
12 genuinely new claimants versus taxpayers who have
13 filed previously and were taking credit -- taking
14 advantage of the new filing. That is the question
15 that I wanted to make sure that we get on the record.
16 I know you don't have the answer today, but we'll
17 come back when we convene again, and have an answer
18 for the public, and move forward on that. Okay. Are
19 we in agreement?

20 MR. TAHARA: I agree, yes. Thank you.

21 CHAIR COHEN: And if everyone was just in
22 agreement with me like that. Thank you. Okay. All
23 right. Let's go ahead.

24 We're going to take public comment. Good
25 job. Good job Dan. We're going to take public

1 comment. Anyone in here? Anyone? Anyone? Anyone?
2 No one. Got it. Okay.

3 Operator, is there anyone online that'd
4 like to comment on this issue, Item Number 3.

5 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
6 on the phone lines, if you would like to place
7 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a
8 reminder, you may press 1 and 0 at this time.

9 And no members of the public are queueing
10 up at this time. Please continue.

11 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
12 much. You guys are dismissed.

13 And next up we're going to have Agenda
14 Item Number 4. Ms. Rubalcava, could you call the
15 role -- or call the item.

16 MS. RUBALCAVA: Yes. Agenda Item 4 is a
17 presentation on Collections Overview, and that is
18 being presented by Javone Tavares and Erica
19 Weatherspoon. This is also an informational item.

20 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you.

21 Don't you fret I have questions for you,
22 too. I don't want you to think I'm favoring
23 speakers. Whenever you're ready, the floor is yours.

24 MR. TAVARES: Good morning, Chair
25 Controller and Members of the Board. My name is

1 Javone Tavares, and I'm a director in the Accounts
2 Receivable Management Division, also known as the ARM
3 Division. And I'm joined by Erica Weatherspoon,
4 director in the ARM Division. We are honored and
5 privileged to be with you today to discuss the ARM
6 Division's role within the Franchise Tax Board. Over
7 the next few minutes, we will provide an overview of
8 how accounts enter the collection cycle, the types of
9 debts we collect, and the strategies and principles
10 that guide our collection efforts. We will also
11 share how we communicate with taxpayers and walk
12 through the key stages of our collection processes.
13 And finally, this presentation will include details
14 about our training program and available resources
15 for staff, collection metrics, services available to
16 assist taxpayers and meet tax obligations, and
17 opportunities for process improvements based on
18 feedback.

19 The ARM Division plays a critical role in
20 supporting the FTB's mission to accurately and fairly
21 administer California tax laws. Our mission as a
22 division is to help taxpayers file timely,
23 accurately, and pay the correct amount. We
24 accomplish this through automated and manual
25 processes to maximize effectiveness and minimize

1 costs to the state of California. We will expand on
2 the differences between automated and manual
3 collection processes in a forthcoming slide.

4 For California taxpayers, there are two
5 pathways to meet their tax obligation. The blue
6 path, where timely, accurate filing and payment
7 occur, and the red path, where timely, accurate
8 filing and payment have not occurred. Red path
9 accounts result in delinquent liabilities being
10 referred to the ARM Division for resolution.
11 Delinquent liabilities flow from self-assessed tax,
12 from tax returns, and non-filer assessments from our
13 filing division, and notices of proposed assessment
14 from our Audit Division. We will share how non-tax
15 debts are referred to FTB in a forthcoming slide.

16 The ARM Division manages and collects
17 delinquent personal income tax and business entity
18 tax for corporations, partnerships, and limited
19 liability companies. As mentioned in a prior slide,
20 we also collect non-tax debts for certain state and
21 local governments. Our current non-tax debt
22 collection programs are for California's courts,
23 delinquent vehicle registration, restitution. And
24 penalties for the CalSavers program. Our collection
25 approach is founded on the principle that we use the

1 least intrusive action first to gain compliance. Our
2 strategy is to educate and encourage taxpayers to
3 resolve their debts as quickly as possible through
4 the method that best suits them and their situation,
5 to help them achieve long-term compliance. As part
6 of taxpayer due process, FTB must notify taxpayers
7 before collecting personal income tax debts.

8 Automated collections begin with an income tax due
9 notice, followed by a final notice before levy after
10 30 days, if unpaid. And collection actions like
11 liens and wage garnishments may then start. For
12 business entities, a past due notice is sent first,
13 followed by a formal demand notice, and a final
14 notice before levy if still unpaid, prompting
15 collection measures. Entities may be suspended from
16 operations after the final notice before suspension
17 and cannot conduct business until revived.

18 Delinquent non-tax debtors receive notices before
19 their cases actually reach FTB. After referral, FTB
20 issues a demand for payment. If unpaid after
21 30 days, involuntary collections may follow. If
22 automated collections fail, cases move to manual
23 collections, where collectors manage accounts,
24 contact taxpayers, and may use advanced collection
25 measures. We also provide specialized collection

1 support services for bankruptcies, offering
2 compromise, innocent spouses, decedents, business
3 transfers, frivolous activity for non-filers,
4 business entity revivers, and administrative
5 dissolutions.

6 Now we like to share how we prepare our
7 staff to deliver service. New collectors go
8 through 9 week -- 9 weeks of trainings, covering
9 technical collection topics, customer service,
10 negotiation, and conflict resolution. Training
11 consists of instructor-led Sessions, computer-based
12 training, or CBT's, scenario-based learning,
13 mentoring, and recurring knowledge checks. Each
14 business area provides onboarding, frequent
15 supervisor and lead meetings, individual check-ins,
16 and continual on the job support to uphold
17 expectations and processes. All staff complete an
18 annual customer service certification CVT, which is
19 currently being updated to reflect new service models
20 and online tools. These efforts help collectors
21 provide accurate consistent and empathetic service,
22 improving compliance and customer experience.

23 Now, I will turn the presentation over to
24 Erica to share some collection metrics, review our
25 collection services, and highlight recent

1 improvements.

2 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you.

3 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Good morning, Chair
4 Controller and Members of the Board. I'd like to
5 share a few key collection metrics for personal
6 income tax, or PIT. These figures use 2025
7 collection balances and 2023 return data, which is
8 our most complete dataset after the 2024 system
9 conversion, as part of the EDR2 project.

10 In 2025, about 1.7 million cases entered
11 collections. 1.2 million cases are in the informed
12 state, where we mail notices to the taxpayer to
13 ensure due process. 400,000 are in automated
14 collections, and 100,000 are in manual collections.
15 Of those cases, 97,000, about 8% claimed the
16 California Earned Income Tax Credit, or CalEITC,
17 Young Child Tax Credit, or Foster Youth Tax Credit.
18 These represent .28% of all tax -- all state -- I'm
19 sorry -- all statewide returns that claim those
20 credits. When personal income taxpayers qualify for
21 refundable credit, some still do owe due to
22 withholding prior debts or other factors.
23 Additionally refundable credit amounts from CalEITC,
24 Young Child Tax Credit, or Foster Youth Tax Credit,
25 are not eligible to offset debts owed to California

1 agencies, cities, counties, and colleges through the
2 Interagency Intercept Collection program, or IIC,
3 except for child support payments.

4 Let's look at open cases by AGI. For AGI
5 under 25,000, this is 16% of cases, with an average
6 balance of about \$2,700. For 25 to 50,000, this is
7 21% of cases, with an average balance of about
8 \$2,300. 50 to a 100,000 is 29% of cases, with an
9 average balance of \$3,000. And over \$100,000 is 34%
10 of cases, with an average balance of about \$11,000.

11 The smallest AGI group shows a relatively
12 high average balance when compared to other AGI
13 groupings. Contributing factors include individual
14 filing circumstances, such as filing status and
15 withholding. Collection balances also span multiple
16 years. So we're seeing a cumulative balance. Filing
17 enforcement assessments also contribute. In this
18 case, 27% of balances stem from assessments when no
19 return was filed. Without a filed return, credits
20 cannot reduce the tax liability. And with the lower
21 AGI, there can be a limited ability to pay, which can
22 extend collection timelines. To support PIT
23 taxpayers, we lead with education, explaining how
24 balances occur, how they can be resolved, and how to
25 avoid future balances. We also offer tailored

1 options, like installment agreements and the ability
2 to skip a payment due to hardship for existing
3 installment agreements when appropriate.

4 So now, we'll shift over to business
5 entity tax collection or BE. BE taxpayers differ
6 significantly from PIT. So we're focusing on a few
7 high level metrics to give a clear overview. These
8 figures use 2026 collection balances and state net
9 income from tax year 2023. Currently we have 652,000
10 accounts in BE collections. 441,000 cases are in the
11 informed state, 30,000 are in automated collections,
12 and 181,000 are in manual collections. Income level
13 doesn't indicate the business size, but most accounts
14 fall within the 0 to \$10,000 range, with smaller
15 portions in the 10 to \$100,000 range, and about 13%
16 above \$100,000. When looking at open collection
17 cases by balance, 80% have balances of \$2,500 or
18 less, averaging about \$700. 9% are between \$2,500
19 and \$5,000, averaging about \$3,500. 4% fall between
20 5 and \$10,000, averaging about \$7,000. And 7% exceed
21 \$10,000 with an average of about a \$103,000. Most
22 businesses have low balances in the system, primarily
23 because many are passed through entities owing only
24 minimum or the annual tax. Suspension and filing
25 enforcement processes also affect these figures. We

1 recognize that many businesses are not in a strong
2 financial standing. When they reach us staff assist
3 them in resolving liabilities to provide education to
4 support long-term compliance. In addition to our
5 phone, chat, and in-person services, our online
6 tools, including online reviver, administrative
7 dissolution applications, and MyFTB self-service
8 options offer convenient ways for businesses to
9 resolve collection issues.

10 I'd like to expand on options available
11 to assist taxpayers. We offer four options to help
12 taxpayers resolve debts. Phone, live chat, and
13 in-person assistance, all available Monday through
14 Friday from 8 to 5. And we have 24/7 self-service
15 tools. For phone and IVR support, taxpayers can use
16 virtual hold to get a call back without waiting on
17 the line. Live chat offers two paths, general chat
18 for quick questions, and MyFTB for secure
19 account-specific help. For in-person assistance, our
20 field offices in Sacramento, Oakland, Los Angeles,
21 Santa Ana, and San Diego, provide face-to-face
22 support with appointments available online. Our 24/7
23 self-service tools allow taxpayers to resolve many
24 issues any time. With multiple channels and around
25 the clock tools, taxpayers can get help when and how

1 it works best for them.

2 In closing, we would like to highlight
3 enhancements to our collection services. The Contact
4 Center Platform Modernization project will replace
5 FTB's current platform, which retires in
6 December 2028, with the new system scheduled to
7 launch in September 2028. The update will offer
8 smart routing, improved support for complex cases,
9 increased automation, and enhanced reporting,
10 resulting in greater efficiency for callers and
11 agents. Second are self-service enhancements.
12 EDemand, the service that allows real estate
13 professionals to request lien payoff amounts has auto
14 routing, automatic case creation for lien program
15 staff, and the ability to upload authorization forms.
16 The IVR now includes speech recognition for tax --
17 and text confirmations for installment agreements.
18 MyFTB now lets taxpayers view lien details, manage
19 withholding orders, request bill delays, and submit
20 tax computations online. Finally, for collection
21 program efforts within the ARM Division, we're using
22 taxpayer feedback from phone calls, self-service
23 tools, and online appointments to improve services.
24 We've increased cross-training to strengthen
25 operational resiliency, and we're refreshing the

1 publicly available collection procedures manual to
2 keep guidance current. Together these updates make
3 it easier for taxpayers to resolve their obligations
4 and help our teams provide more effective service.

5 This concludes our presentation this
6 morning, and we hope this information shared has
7 provided a clear, comprehensive, and informative
8 overview of our collection program. At this time, we
9 would be pleased to address any questions you may
10 have. Thank you.

11 CHAIR COHEN: Great, thank you. Now,
12 this is an item that was brought to us by Member
13 Lieber. So I'm going to pivot to you and let you
14 take it away.

15 MS. LIEBER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
16 And I think it was really kind of covers here, our
17 interest in this very large part of what we're doing
18 as an agency. And thank you to our executive officer
19 as well for her work on this, and staff also.

20 I want -- my first question is penalties
21 for CalSavers. Can you share some information about
22 how that situation comes about?

23 MR. TAVARES: Yes, certainly. Thank you
24 for the question. So for CalSavers, they receive
25 some initial notices, and so once those notices are

1 received, then they will come to FTB, if they don't
2 respond to those notices for CalSavers. So at that
3 time, there are some penalties that are associated
4 for not responding. But ultimately, in our
5 partnership with CalSavers, one of the things that
6 they shared is they're not really interested in the
7 penalties. They're really more or less interested in
8 getting folks to sign up for the for the program. So
9 we do see the back end of that piece where it comes
10 to the notices that FTB has sent out, in addition to
11 the notices that went out from CalSavers at first.

12 MS. LIEBER: Okay. And just for people
13 in the community who may be watching, can you give us
14 a real brief synopsis of CalSavers and how people get
15 in trouble with it?

16 MR. TAVARES: Yeah. So --

17 MS. LIEBER: It sounds like a good thing,
18 and yet.

19 MR. TAVARES: Absolutely. So for
20 CalSavers, initially meant for employers that
21 currently don't have any sort of retirement. I think
22 that initiative was to allow for those businesses to
23 be able to provide some sort of retirement options.
24 And so what happens is with the CalSavers program,
25 they will send out notices to the business community.

1 And so when they do that, it was really done based on
2 how many employees that each business had. So there
3 had been a bunch of notices that have gone out
4 saying, "Hey, this is a good thing for you to have an
5 opportunity to sign up for." And so it does mention
6 that there could be some penalties for not signing up
7 or opting out of that program. So for the tax
8 community out there, it's probably best to be able to
9 respond to those notices before they actually get to
10 Franchise Tax Board, and that's when the penalties
11 could potentially happen.

12 MS. LIEBER: Okay, thank you. And then
13 on slide seven, there are 97,000 CalEITC recipients
14 that are part of the collection sphere. And I think
15 there was one of the programs named -- I don't know
16 if it was CalEITC, Young Child Tax Credit, or Foster
17 Youth Tax Credit, that can't be seized as part of the
18 collection action, if I was understanding that
19 correctly. Or can the FTB take any of those tax
20 credits to satisfy a tax debt?

21 MS. WEATHERSPOON: So those programs for
22 the -- for those 97,000 what happens there is, they
23 cannot be they cannot be offset by the programs for
24 IIC. However, like the IRS, we satisfy our
25 outstanding debts before we issue refunds.

1 MS. LIEBER: Okay. So someone could be
2 signing up for EITC, or Foster Youth, or Young Child.
3 And so would that -- would they simply not get the
4 tax credit, or the tax credit would be used to
5 satisfy the debt?

6 MS. WEATHERSPOON: So your entire refund,
7 including that refundable credit, could be used as
8 part of the amount to reduce your tax liability. So
9 if you have a -- if you get a refundable credit and
10 you have a tax liability, that refundable credit is
11 used to reduce your tax liability.

12 MS. LIEBER: Okay.

13 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Just for us. But we
14 are not offsetting that for any of the programs that
15 we have in partnership with any of our partners.

16 MS. LIEBER: Okay. And then on slide
17 eight, the business entity tax collection data,
18 balance ranges 2500 or less are 80% of the total pool
19 of what's owed?

20 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Which slide was that?
21 I'm sorry.

22 MS. LIEBER: Slide eight.

23 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Okay. So that's --
24 yeah. So that's for the -- that's usually for the
25 business entities that are the pass-through entities.

1 So they usually only owe like the annual or the
2 minimum tax, which is like \$800 a year. And so they
3 end up only owing a very small amount in our systems.

4 MS. LIEBER: Okay. So it looks like
5 there's a large number of folks who maybe are not
6 paying that minimum corporate tax, and that's why
7 that's such a large number. And so do they -- if
8 they are not paying that and maybe they try to start
9 a business with high hopes and not a lot of
10 experience, and are we putting force majeure onto
11 getting that that average collection balance of \$700
12 or what happened there?

13 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Well, what we can say
14 is that we don't necessarily have specific metrics on
15 that. But what we can say is that most of our
16 revenue and case resolution happens within those
17 earlier states of collection. So 80%, usually we
18 collect in those earlier states, in the automated
19 state. So we can usually resolve most of those cases
20 very early before they get to the manual collection
21 stage.

22 MS. LIEBER: Okay. Okay. I think that's
23 all my questions for now. Thank you.

24 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you.
25 Okay. I have three questions, but they're pretty

1 intense. We don't have a lot of time, so I might
2 have to modify my questions to you. Okay. So okay.

3 So there's 97,000 EITC claimants that are
4 in the personal income tax collection pipeline. And
5 that -- meaning that these are low-income working
6 families who receive a refundable credit, and they're
7 simultaneously being pursued for other tax debts;
8 okay? And my question is, does the Franchise Tax
9 Board have a policy on offsetting EITC refunds
10 against delinquent balances? Now this is an age
11 old -- I should be looking over here. This is an age
12 old kind of dilemma; right? We are giving money, but
13 they also owe someplace else. So my question is, how
14 does that discrepancy interact with the stated goal
15 of supporting low-income Californians through the tax
16 credit; okay? So we're giving them money. They're
17 qualifying for the tax credit. They received it, but
18 say they owe something. Another -- they're
19 delinquent on some other tax bill. How do -- how are
20 we reconciling that?

21 MS. WEATHERSPOON: The tax bill with
22 Franchise Tax Board or a bill somewhere else.

23 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. Sorry. So in the
24 State Controller's Office, we have people who owe
25 child support.

1 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Right.

2 CHAIR COHEN: We have people who owe back
3 taxes. We have people who owe --

4 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Right.

5 CHAIR COHEN: What is it when you're
6 divorced and you give -- thank you. Alimony. So
7 that's what I mean. Or maybe they didn't pay their
8 taxes in full last year. So that is what I'm trying
9 to say. How do they reconcile?

10 MS. WEATHERSPOON: So outside of
11 outstanding balances with their taxes at the
12 Franchise Tax Board, the only thing -- the only other
13 thing that would offset that balance is child
14 support.

15 CHAIR COHEN: Okay.

16 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Yeah, that's it.

17 CHAIR COHEN: I didn't know that. That's
18 good to know.

19 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Yeah.

20 CHAIR COHEN: In the presentation -- in
21 the presentation notes, you noted that 80% of the
22 business entity tax, the BET, accounts in collections
23 have balances of \$2,500 or less and an average
24 balance of \$700. Here's the question: What does it
25 actually cost Franchise Tax Board per account to

1 process a business entity account through the fully
2 automated collections cycle?

3 MS. WEATHERSPOON: So for 24/25, our
4 CBR -- well, I'll give you the cost.

5 CHAIR COHEN: Okay.

6 MS. WEATHERSPOON: For 24/25, for BE, our
7 cost was about \$67 million. However our CBR for
8 24/25 --

9 CHAIR COHEN: What does CBR stand for?

10 MS. WEATHERSPOON: CBR, cost benefit
11 ratio.

12 CHAIR COHEN: Okay.

13 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Was about \$20.51,
14 meaning that for every dollar we spent, we brought in
15 \$20.51.

16 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. That's not bad.

17 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Yeah.

18 CHAIR COHEN: It's not bad. Okay. Thank
19 you. So you answered my question. I wanted to know
20 if it was a net negative for the state.

21 MS. WEATHERSPOON: No.

22 CHAIR COHEN: But it sounds like it's a
23 no.

24 MS. WEATHERSPOON: We actually make money
25 for every dollar that we spend.

1 CHAIR COHEN: That's good to know.

2 MS. WEATHERSPOON: Yeah.

3 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you. Did anyone else
4 know that in here? They're like, "Yeah, we know."
5 Okay. Show offs. I see you in the back. Okay.

6 Third question. The presentation doesn't
7 include any data on taxpayer hardship requests. So
8 I'm thinking about the payment plan utilization or
9 the OIC, which is the offer in compromise approval
10 rating -- rates. Can you guys give me some context
11 around this? Can you describe the volume or the
12 outcomes of this relief mechanism?

13 MR. TAVARES: You want to, or --

14 MS. WEATHERSPOON: We can come back.

15 MR. TAVARES: Yeah. It'd probably be
16 best if we got you some additional information.

17 CHAIR COHEN: Okay.

18 MR. TAVARES: Just contextually, as Erica
19 mentioned, we really try to lead with education and
20 outreach. So for those individuals that may be
21 experiencing a hardship, we really want to help them
22 understand what their options are. And then our
23 goal, again, is long-term compliance. So we really
24 want to focus on the education piece, because as much
25 as we like helping them out, we don't necessarily

1 want to see them again in collections.

2 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. I got it. Do you
3 see the same people in collections over and over
4 again? Or is it -- is there an attrition rate? Like
5 once people get out of collections, then there's a
6 new bunch of people? Just generally speaking.

7 MR. TAVARES: I think generally speaking,
8 again, we don't necessarily have metrics on that.

9 CHAIR COHEN: Okay.

10 MR. TAVARES: But we do have information
11 for individuals that have multiple tax years that
12 they owe for. So that could be an indicator that
13 perhaps things haven't gone right for more than a
14 couple years?

15 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. Here's another
16 question. This relates more, I guess, to business
17 and I guess so in some way personal. Can -- say
18 there's a Californian that is delinquent in our
19 state, but they're also delinquent in Nevada or other
20 states, are we tracking that?

21 MR. TAVARES: So -- a great question. So
22 we do have a reciprocal collections program -- really
23 not collections. It's a reciprocal offset program.
24 We have a couple agreements with the State of New
25 Jersey, the State of New York, as well as the State

1 of Connecticut. So if you have someone that lives in
2 California that now moves to Connecticut, they will
3 not get a refund in Connecticut. Connecticut will
4 send their refund to offset the California debt and
5 vice versa for those other states, as well. So we've
6 been looking to expand that program for a while, but
7 some states don't have the necessary legislative
8 authority to participate in that. So we really want
9 to expand that program with as many states as
10 possible, because there's a benefit to our state and
11 those states as well.

12 CHAIR COHEN: Perhaps that's something we
13 could reach out to our congressional delegation and
14 have them begin to look at or be a champion. That
15 would be very helpful for not only California filers,
16 but also across the entire state. All right. Thank
17 you very much.

18 I'm going to move on to public comment.
19 Anyone in this chamber would like to take public
20 comment? All right.

21 Operator, is there anyone online that'd
22 like to comment on this item.

23 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
24 on the phone lines, if you would like to place
25 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a

1 reminder, you may press 1 then 0 at this time.

2 And you have a comment from Christine
3 Grab, an individual taxpayer. Please go ahead.

4 MS. GRAB: I want to remind FTB staff
5 that unsigned documents have no legal validity. FTB
6 standard operating procedure is to issue notices,
7 wage garnishments, liens, and levies that are
8 unsigned and therefore fraudulent. If a collection
9 agent tries to take money from people based on these
10 fraudulent notices, you can be personally prosecuted
11 by the federal government for RICO. As was
12 determined in the Nuremburg trials, "I was just doing
13 my job" is not a valid legal defense. The reason the
14 notices are unsigned is because the attorneys in the
15 legal department know they are violating our federal
16 constitutional rights, which guarantee a jury trial
17 before collection instruments can be imposed. They
18 know whoever signs the document can be prosecuted for
19 RICO. I request that FTB immediately make it a
20 policy that all documents issued by FTB be signed by
21 someone in the legal department. No more framing
22 people in other departments for crimes perpetrated by
23 the attorneys. I also request that FTB immediately
24 alter its procedures to include trials prior to the
25 imposition of collection instruments. Thank you.

1 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you, Ms. Grab.

2 Are there any other members of the public
3 that'd like to speak, Mr. Operator?

4 THE AT&T OPERATOR: No members of the
5 public are queueing up at this time. Please
6 continue.

7 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
8 much. Thank you for the presentation.

9 Yes?

10 MS. LIEBER: Just a quick question. When
11 we get the information back, as the Chair indicated,
12 I'd love to see more unpacking of that lowest amount
13 or the average collection balance is \$700. And I
14 think it's very laudable in terms of our
15 responsibility to taxpayers overall to be getting \$20
16 on a dollar of collections activity. But how much is
17 our work destabilizing people who are just barely
18 above indigent and doing the dog paddle as hard as
19 they can to keep going? And I'd love to know back
20 from staff if it would take a change the revenue tax
21 code to have Young Child Tax Credit flow through
22 regardless. Because that money is for the child, and
23 it shouldn't be held up by whatever the parents'
24 complications are. So I'd love to know at a later
25 date how we can change that and if it is a code

1 change. Thank you.

2 CHAIR COHEN: Noted. Thank you.

3 Thank you for your presentation.

4 I'd like to call Item 6. Thank you.

5 MS. RUBALCAVA: Agenda Item 6 is
6 Administrative Matters. First, we'll have Michael
7 Banuelos presenting the contracts over 2 million for
8 Board approval, and then Abel Escobar and
9 Rosita Mindermann will present the Conceptual 2027/28
10 Budget Change Proposals, which is an informational
11 item.

12 MR. BANUELOS: Good afternoon, Chair
13 Controller and Board Members. My name is
14 Michael Banuelos, and I'm the director of the
15 Franchise Tax Board's Procurement Bureau. I'm here
16 today to present two proposed procurements that
17 result in contracts over \$2 million for the Board's
18 approval. I sense we're running a little bit short
19 of time, so I will try and be succinct.

20 The first request seeks approval to
21 initiate procurement activities to renew a software
22 maintenance contract for software AG products in use
23 on our mainframe computer system. This is a renewal
24 of a contract for tools used to support our mission
25 critical tax processing systems, including our

1 taxpayer information and business entities tax
2 systems. FTB has been using these products for
3 approximately 40 years, as they are extremely stable.
4 Without maintenance and continued migration to vendor
5 supported software releases, this mission critical
6 software would be unsupported, inoperable, and
7 without warranty. The department would not be able
8 to perform many of its revenue generating functions
9 or various collection related tasks that involve our
10 mainframe computer. In September of this year, our
11 existing five-year agreement valued at \$10,980,000
12 expires. We're anticipating another five-year
13 agreement, and the final price will be determined
14 based upon a negotiated process.

15 Our second request is for the Board's
16 approval to enter into an interagency agreement with
17 the California Department of Community Services and
18 Development, or CSD, to support the California Earned
19 Income Tax Credit program, or CalEITC. The
20 administration's fiscal year 26/27 proposed budget
21 includes 10 million in outreach funds dedicated to
22 increase awareness of and participation in CalEITC.
23 Each year FTB enters into an interagency agreement
24 with CSD to distribute the outreach funds to
25 nonprofits and community-based organizations through

1 CSD's existing grant infrastructure. The proposed
2 agreement is for \$10,969,000. This includes 10
3 million to be distributed, as well as an estimated
4 \$969,000 in reimbursement for CSD's administrative
5 and operational costs during the 26/27 fiscal year.

6 At this time, I'm re respectfully asking
7 for your approval of these two procurement efforts
8 and would be happy to answer any questions you may
9 have.

10 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you very much. I'm
11 going to go ahead and jump to the Members' questions;
12 okay? Michelle Perrault? No. Okay. None, wow. Oh
13 man. Hold on. Now I'm on the hot spot. We got to
14 get you at least one. All right. Let's go ahead.
15 We're going to -- I have one.

16 So the \$969,000 in the CSD administrative
17 cost represents about 10% of the agreement value.
18 Here is the question. What does CSD's administrative
19 role actually entail, and has FTB evaluated whether
20 those functions could be performed more cost
21 effectively through another mechanism?

22 MR. BANUELOS: They have oversight over
23 the entire program. So it's a little bit different
24 based on each year what they're doing for us. So
25 last year they renewed the grant of all the grantees.

1 So they actually had to do basically an entire new
2 bid for us, which constituted an actual lot of work.
3 It's a grant. It's a little bit different, but
4 basically it's essentially like doing a complete bid.
5 I can't remember the exact number, but there's
6 probably about -- I would say about 13 different
7 grantees. Probably upwards of 15 contracts that they
8 have to do. Doling out \$10 million worth of money to
9 all of these grantees, tracking the work plans of all
10 that, tracking the invoices, making sure that all the
11 work that gets done. That's a significant amount of
12 work that needs to be done, auditing those -- the
13 invoices that come in, tracking those, making sure
14 they're approved for payment. That is a lot of work.
15 We have not looked into, is there an alternative way
16 of doing that. We've been very satisfied that the
17 work that they are doing for us is well worth the
18 amount of money that we're doing. There is a portion
19 of money that's in there that we are also paying for
20 some of their IT costs. A few years ago they
21 implemented a reporting system for the grantees to
22 enter data into a portal, so that they could get
23 better reporting statistics in there. So overall,
24 we've been very satisfied, but no, we have not looked
25 into an alternative way --

1 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you.

2 MR. BANUELOS: -- of spending that money.

3 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you. Thank you for
4 the presentation. Any members of the public in the
5 chamber would like to comment on this item? All
6 right.

7 Mr. Operator, please, online is -- are
8 there any public commenters?

9 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
10 on the phone lines if you would like to place
11 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a
12 reminder, you may press 1 then 0 at this time.

13 And you have a comment from Christine
14 Grab, an individual taxpayer. Please go ahead.

15 MS. GRAB: I'm requesting that instead of
16 giving money to NGO's, that FTB paid professional tax
17 preparers to file returns for people who qualify
18 under VITA guidelines. I believe that the tax
19 preparers would effectively advertise so that people
20 were aware that they could get their taxes done for
21 free and get cash in hand. And they'd likely do a
22 better job of advertising than the NGO's currently
23 are. In "Grab versus FTB" in San Diego Superior
24 Court, FTB never denied the allegations that my
25 penalties were a result of an embezzlement and

1 racketeering scheme. Failure to deny constitutes
2 admission of truth. While I am not low-income --

3 MR. HOFELING: This does not appear to be
4 related to the topic of the contract itself and is
5 relating to a personal litigation matter.

6 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. Thank you very much.
7 Are there any other members of the public
8 that would like to speak online?

9 THE AT&T OPERATOR: No members of the
10 public --

11 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you.

12 THE AT&T OPERATOR: No members of the
13 public are queueing up at this time.

14 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you. And again just
15 for the record, the member of the public was speaking
16 on a topic that was of personal -- a personal
17 litigation to her, not on -- what's on the agenda.

18 So with that said, thank you very much,
19 Mr. Banuelos, for your presentation.

20 Members, colleagues, is there a motion on
21 the contracts over 2 million?

22 MS. PERRAULT: So moved.

23 MS. LIEBER: So moved.

24 CHAIR COHEN: All right. The motion is
25 moved by Perrault, seconded by Lieber. Can we take

1 this with that objection? All right. Without
2 objection, the motion passes unanimously. Thank you.

3 MR. BANUELOS: Thank you for your time.

4 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you.
5 Let's go ahead and call Item 5. Excuse me, I'm
6 sorry. Item 6B.

7 MR. ESCOBAR: Good afternoon, Chair
8 Controller and Members of the Board. My name is
9 Abel Escobar, director of the Financial Management
10 Bureau. I am joined by Rosita Mindermann, an
11 assistant bureau director of the External Budget
12 Office. We are here today to provide an
13 informational presentation on the budget change
14 proposal concepts that are under development for the
15 fiscal year 2027/28. We will provide a brief
16 overview of each concept, and then answer any
17 questions you may have. If appropriate, we will
18 return at the September Board Meeting with fully
19 developed proposals for your approval.

20 In 2008 franchise tax board began a
21 multiphase project to modernize processes,
22 applications, and systems. We all know this as the
23 Enterprise Data to Revenue, Phase One, or the EDR1
24 project. At the end of this first phase, FTB
25 received funding for maintenance and operations.

1 After several years, there have been significant
2 price increases exceeding the current budget. The
3 EDR1 MNO Augmentation Concept requests additional
4 funding to cover increasing costs associated with
5 software licensing, hardware refresh cycles, and
6 third-party support contracts that are essential to
7 maintaining FTB's mission critical systems. The
8 augmentation will ensure that FTB can continue to
9 safeguard taxpayer data and remain compliant with
10 state and federal security requirements. As we start
11 discussions for the third and final phase of the EDR
12 project, the objective of the next concept is to
13 prepare the department and lay the groundwork for
14 this upcoming phase. The Accounting Systems Business
15 Rules Extraction Concept requests funding for ongoing
16 vendor service and software to implement an automated
17 tool solution to document current business rules and
18 evaluate system functionality. This effort will
19 support modernization of FTB's critical internal
20 enterprise accounting systems known as taxpayer
21 information system and business entities taxation
22 system, that support personal and business entity
23 accounts. As technology solutions continue to evolve
24 in age, current systems require modernization along
25 with a refresh of key components. These next two

1 concepts address these changes.

2 The Contact Sensor Platform
3 Modernization, or CCPM, concept requests funding to
4 purchase a modern, secure, and scalable cloud-based
5 contact center platform, or CCP, and voice over
6 internet protocol, or VOIP, solution from a CALNET
7 authorized vendor. This investment will replace
8 FTB's aging on premises CCP and VOIP system and
9 ensure uninterrupted delivery of taxpayer services.
10 It will also allow new opportunities for improvements
11 to the customer experience aligned with statewide
12 directives.

13 Now, I will pass it over to my colleague,
14 Rosita, to present the remaining concepts.

15 MS. MINDERMAN: Thank you, Abel.

16 Good afternoon, Chair Controller and
17 Members of the Board. The last local area network,
18 or LAN, refresh BCP was approved in 2019/20 at a one
19 time cost of 5.9 million, to update and improve the
20 department's network through the LAN Infrastructure
21 Refresh Project. Fast forward to 2026, when various
22 components are reaching end of maintenance and will
23 soon stop receiving regular updates or support. The
24 LAN Switch Supervisor Engine Refresh Concept requests
25 funding to replace aging network control units,

1 called supervisor engines, along with their software.
2 The supervisor engines, or control units, are
3 installed in network devices used across central and
4 district offices. By updating them, we'll keep our
5 network running smoothly and avoid problems when the
6 old equipment is no longer supported. These modules
7 are responsible for managing the flow of data between
8 staff devices and critical FTB systems.

9 Next is the Political Reform Audit
10 Resources Concept. The Political Reform Audit
11 program, or PRA program, within the Franchise Tax
12 Board audits state and local political entities,
13 pursuant to Government Code Section 90000. The PRA
14 program determines their compliance with political
15 reform acts, disclosure, and record keeping
16 requirements, as well as educate filers to improve
17 future compliance. This concept requests additional
18 resources and funding to effectively administer the
19 PRA program, as mandated by the Political Reform Act
20 of 1974. These resources will allow FTB to complete
21 additional mandatory audits, strengthen oversight of
22 political activity, support enforcement by the Fair
23 Political Practice Commission, improve transparency
24 for the public, and provide the ongoing technical
25 support needed to maintain and enhance PRA's audit

1 systems.

2 Next is the Asset Forfeiture Account
3 Spending Authority Increased Concept. FTB's Criminal
4 Investigation Bureau investigates alleged criminal
5 violations of the revenue and taxation code
6 independently and partners with city, county, state,
7 and federal agencies for enforcement. Through these
8 joint efforts and under the guidelines of the Guide
9 to Equitable Sharing for State, Local, and Tribal Law
10 Enforcement Agencies' March 2024 Agreement, FTB
11 received an equitable share of the monetary recovery.
12 And that equitable share was deposited into FTB's
13 asset forfeiture account to supplement CIB's
14 operational budget. However, as program eligibility
15 requirements evolved under federal guidelines, FTB
16 was deemed ineligible to continue receiving monetary
17 recovery funds, because FTB's primary goal and
18 mission are not law enforcement. FTB received an
19 extension to spend current account funds until
20 June 2030. After June 2030, FTB will no longer be
21 able to use these funds, and the funds will revert
22 back to the US Treasury or the General Fund. This
23 concept requests an increase in spending authority
24 through fiscal year 2029/30 for the asset forfeiture
25 account, to spend the funds within the account, to

1 support the purchase of permissible resources for
2 investigation activities that support FTB strategic
3 goals.

4 Lastly, the Campus Security Upgrades
5 Concept is a capital outlay proposal concept
6 requesting funding to upgrade physical security at
7 the central office campus, enhancing protection
8 against threats, and ensuring operational continuity.
9 These measures will reinforce the department's
10 ability to respond and to mitigate physical security
11 risks. Ensuring the safety of the State assets and
12 taxpayer information. The proposed improvements will
13 bolster FTB's capacity to safeguard the campus,
14 maintaining secure and uninterrupted operations in
15 the face of emergency challenges.

16 So this concludes our presentation of the
17 budget change proposal concepts under development for
18 the fiscal year 2027/28, and we'd be happy to answer
19 any questions you may have.

20 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you very much.

21 Member Lieber, do you have any questions?

22 MS. LIEBER: No.

23 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. I ran out of steam.
24 I gave my best stuff on the previous. I don't have
25 any questions for you either.

1 So we are going to take a moment. We're
2 going to go ahead and go to public comment. Anyone
3 in the in the chamber? All right.

4 Mr. Operator, could you please check to
5 see if there's any public comment online?

6 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
7 on the phone lines, if you would like to place
8 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a
9 reminder, you may press 1 and 0 at this time.

10 No members of the public are queueing up
11 at this time. Please continue.

12 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you.

13 MR. ESCOBAR: Thank you for your time.

14 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you for your
15 presentation.

16 All right. Madame Rubalcava. All right.
17 We're going to go back to Item 5, Legislative
18 Updates.

19 MS. RUBALCAVA: Yes, agenda Item 5 is a
20 presentation on the Legislative Update, and it is
21 being presented by Wendy Cramer. This is also an
22 informational item.

23 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you.

24 MS. CRAMER: Good afternoon, Chair
25 Controller and Members of the Board. My name is

1 Wendy Cramer, and I am the assistant director of
2 legislative services for the Franchise Tax Board.
3 I'm here today to present a mid-session legislative
4 update on bills that if chaptered could impact the
5 Franchise Tax Board.

6 We are now well within the second year of
7 the 2025/2026 legislative session, where May 29th was
8 the last day for bills to move from the house of
9 origin to the Second House. The next major milestone
10 is August 31st, when all remaining bills must be sent
11 to the governor. The legislature met the June 15th
12 deadline to pass the state budget. Legislative
13 Services Bureau is currently monitoring 38 bills that
14 advanced to the second house. Of those, ten are
15 two-year bills and the remaining 28 were introduced
16 to this year. I will be highlighting a few of those
17 bills for you today.

18 I will begin with Senate Bill 1435. This
19 bill contains cleanup language for Senate Bill 711,
20 the specified date conformity bill chaptered in
21 October of 2025. In addition to a number of
22 technical changes, this bill contains two provisions
23 that would clarify California's conformity to federal
24 law. The first provision clarifies that California's
25 modification to the disqualified investment income

1 amount would remain \$3,400 indexed for inflation, for
2 purposes of the California Earned Income Tax Credit,
3 or the CalEITC. This means that FTB would continue
4 to disallow the CalEITC if the taxpayer's aggregate
5 amount of investment income exceeds \$3,400 indexed
6 for inflation.

7 The second provision would make a small
8 technical change. When Senate bill 711 was
9 chaptered, it included nonconformity to the
10 limitation on business interest for corporate tax
11 purposes, but the personal income tax limitation was
12 inadvertently omitted. This provision would add the
13 corresponding nonconformity for personal income tax
14 purposes. This would ensure consistent application
15 of the law for both personal and corporate tax by
16 clarifying that California would not conform to the
17 federal modification to the limitation on business
18 interest under Internal Revenue Code Section 163(j)
19 Senate Bill 1435 would be effective upon enactment
20 and specifically operative for taxable years
21 beginning on or after January 1, 2025, consistent
22 with the specified date in Senate Bill 711.

23 Assembly Bill 1519 would redefine tax
24 liability for purposes of the 20-year statute of
25 limitations for collection activity. This new

1 definition would clarify that tax liability due and
2 payable would no longer include interest, penalties,
3 costs, and fees relating to the assessment of tax and
4 would specify that the statute of limitations for
5 these items would run concurrently with the related
6 underlying tax liability. This means that when
7 interest, penalties, costs, or fees are assessed, it
8 would not reset the 20-year statute of limitations.
9 If chaptered this bill would be effective and
10 operative on January 1, 2027.

11 Senate Bill 1436 would conform to the
12 federal increase in the contribution limit for
13 beneficiaries of Achieving a Better Life Experience
14 account, also known as ABLE accounts, beginning in
15 January of 2026. The One Big Beautiful Bill Act made
16 the temporary increase limitation permanent. This
17 increased limitation allows a designated beneficiary
18 of an ABLE account to contribute additional amounts
19 to the account after the overall contribution limit
20 has been reached. This new contribution limit would
21 be the lower of the federal poverty line for a one
22 person household or the beneficiary's income. This
23 contribution limit would also be indexed for
24 inflation.

25 The Department Of Finance recently

1 released its May Revision Trailer Bill language,
2 which included three provisions that would impact the
3 Franchise Tax Board. Please note that these
4 proposals are a work in progress and may change over
5 the next few weeks. My summary will include a few of
6 the changes that have already been proposed.

7 The first provision would create a
8 permanent business tax credit limitation. This
9 proposal is similar to the current temporary credit
10 limitation of \$5 million. However, unlike the
11 current limitation, it would limit the use of
12 business tax credits to the greater of \$5 million or
13 a specified percentage of tax liability. This
14 proposal would not apply to any credit refund
15 election allowed as part of the current temporary
16 credit limitation, nor the annual refundable election
17 amounts allowed for the Motion Picture Credit. Also
18 this proposal would not apply to the Low-Income
19 Housing Credit.

20 The second provision includes a temporary
21 annual tax reduction for limited liability
22 corporations, limited liability partnerships, and
23 limited partnerships, from \$800 to \$400 for taxpayers
24 in their first year of business for tax years 2027,
25 2028, and 2029.

1 The third provision would conform to the
2 federal treatment of Internal Revenue Code
3 Section 530(a) accounts beginning in tax year 2026.
4 This treatment would be similar and consistent with
5 the general practice of conforming to federal law for
6 tax advantage savings and retirement accounts.

7 This concludes my mid-session legislative
8 update. Thank you, Chair Controller and Members of
9 the Board, for your time today. I'm happy to answer
10 any questions you may have.

11 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you very much for the
12 presentation. We do have questions for you.

13 Member Lieber?

14 MS. LIEBER: I have a number of
15 questions, but I'm going to satisfy them all by going
16 online and taking a look at these individual bills,
17 because there's a lot to work with here. So thank
18 you.

19 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. So as it relates to
20 Assembly Bill 1519, the modified statute of
21 limitations on collections, I understand that's a
22 pretty controversial piece of legislation. And I
23 think if I remember correctly the governor vetoed
24 another version of this -- was it last year?

25 MS. CRAMER: You are correct.

1 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. All right. And at
2 least the -- let's see, is this legislation going to
3 cost the Franchise Tax Board \$10 million?

4 MS. CRAMER: No, it is not going to cost
5 the Franchise Tax Board \$10 million. The revenue
6 cost was updated recently because new data was
7 identified. The estimated amount of debts that would
8 be discharged as a result of this bill is
9 approximately \$100,000.

10 CHAIR COHEN: Okay, that's not so bad.
11 So I wanted to just take a few minutes to discuss
12 AB 1519, because I think that the bill deserves a
13 more thorough conversation than we usually do on a
14 typical legislative update. AB 1519 proposes to
15 redefine tax liability, and that will definitely
16 change the way we do business and conduct business
17 here in the State of California. And this is a
18 significant change that could affect tens of
19 thousands of accounts in the current collections
20 pipeline. And I want to acknowledge that Assembly
21 Member Gibson is addressing something that is real,
22 in the way that California's current statute of
23 limitations on collection works. So this 20-year
24 window can be extended, sometimes significantly, by
25 the imposition of a new of a new interest or penalty

1 charge on an old liability. And so that means a
2 taxpayer who's been living with decades old tax -- a
3 decade old tax debt, who they believe -- who may have
4 believed that they were close to the end of the
5 collection period, that they can find out -- that
6 they can find a window to reset by an administrative
7 action that they didn't quite anticipate. And I can
8 think of a couple of people even in my own personal
9 circle of businesses that would benefit from such
10 legislation. Now, to be fair, I'm not supporting or
11 denying any legislation. Don't misconstrue my
12 comments. I'm just -- we're just having a robust
13 discussion on the legislative legitimacy of this
14 legislation. And this is one of my favorite sections
15 on the agenda, because the legislative update is
16 important. Because it highlights clearly how the
17 work of this body connects to what's happening in the
18 capital. And that's something I believe is
19 fundamental to the work of this Board, the importance
20 of staying meaningfully connected to the legislative
21 process as the bills move through the capital. It's
22 not something that's abstract. Anything that is
23 going to touch -- every bill that touches the revenue
24 taxation code has a potential to change something
25 real in all of our lives, whether we realize it or

1 not. It could change how much we owe. It could
2 change what credits one is able to claim, how long a
3 debt can follow us, what it costs to even start and
4 do -- conduct business in the State of California.
5 So these are all very, very, very relevant, and the
6 legislature is making these decisions right now in
7 real time. And so this Board has both the authority
8 and the responsibility to be informed on the process.
9 So thank you for the presentation. I realize that
10 there are Californians, not only the ones in this
11 room, but also outside, that are counting on us to do
12 our job and to be aggressive. So I really look
13 forward to the presentation. And so I guess in
14 September, on our final legislative update, I am
15 watching the legislation that you've highlighted for
16 us quickly. And I want to pivot to our retired
17 member of the legislature, Sally Lieber.

18 MS. LIEBER: Thank you. And it is
19 getting down to the critical time within both houses.
20 And so I'm looking forward to the September update,
21 as well, and then an update on what happens during
22 the bill signing season, too. And I would remark
23 from the BOE perspective that we've taken a much more
24 assertive role at the BOE in the past year or so,
25 taking positions on bills that we think meet the

1 policy needs of our constituents. And so we'll be
2 looking closely at these. Thank you so much.

3 CHAIR COHEN: I just want to go back to
4 the legislation -- what was it? AB 1519? What I
5 didn't see in the analysis is the mention of the one
6 time transactional impact of the retroactive
7 provision. Do you have any comment on that?

8 MS. CRAMER: The one-time impact of --

9 CHAIR COHEN: Yeah. The one time
10 transaction impact of the retroactive provision. So
11 the bill would apply it to liabilities due and
12 payable going back to July of 2006. And then, of
13 course, this legislation goes into effect on
14 January 1st of 2027. But what happens to the
15 accounts currently in FTB's collections pipeline that
16 that become time-barred under this new definition? I
17 know you don't have the answers, but I'm reading this
18 into the record so that we can begin to think
19 critically and look at how this is going to impact
20 how we do business here.

21 Erin, do you have a comment?

22 MS. DENDORFER: I do, yes. We're
23 currently in the process of updating our analysis to
24 reflect the new data that Wendy mentioned.

25 CHAIR COHEN: Oh, perfect. All right.

1 Well then, with that said, I also want to understand
2 the implementation picture -- large picture. FTB is
3 looking at a system changes and staff retraining that
4 is going to begin to be around what, \$855,000 plus,
5 in the first year and rise over 1.5 million in year
6 two if this bill is signed in September or October.
7 So we will have roughly 90 days to operationally get
8 ready for the January 1st effective date. And I
9 don't want us to get caught flatfooted.

10 So, ladies and gentlemen, don't worry.
11 We're on top of it. We will work to together. We
12 will solve this collectively. Thank you for your
13 presentation.

14 Let's go ahead to public comment. Anyone
15 in the chamber would like to comment on all this
16 exciting business? Nobody? Okay, thank you.

17 Okay. Mr. Operator, online. Any
18 comments online?

19 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
20 on the phone line, if you would like to place
21 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a
22 reminder, you may press 1 and 0 at this time.

23 And at this time you have a comment from
24 Joyce Cheng, from the California Society of Enrolled
25 Agents. Please go ahead.

1 MS. CHENG: Good morning. On behalf of
2 the California Society of Enrolled Agents, having
3 personally worked on this revised AB 1519, I would
4 like to point out that it -- the retroactive
5 provision was removed. That is no longer part of the
6 of AB 1519. So that it would only affect accounts
7 going forward from the effective date of the bill.
8 And -- I apologize. There was another issue to
9 mention. The definition of tax, removing the
10 penalties, interest, fees, and costs, specifically
11 only relates to this piece of legislation, this
12 particular code section. It does not apply to any
13 other tax liability in another situation. It only
14 applies with respect to the statute of limitations.
15 And I trust that the Board will look closely at the
16 proposed legislation as written. Thank you so much.

17 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you for the
18 clarification. We appreciate that.

19 Mr. Operator, anyone else?

20 THE AT&T OPERATOR: No members of the
21 public are queueing up at this time. Please
22 continue.

23 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
24 much. This concludes this portion of the agenda.
25 Let's go ahead and call Item Number 7.

1 MS. RUBALCAVA: Item 7 on the agenda is
2 Executive Officer's Time, and I will turn it over to
3 Selvi Stanislaus.

4 CHAIR COHEN: Great.

5 MS. STANISLAUS: Thank you. Good
6 afternoon, Controller and Members of the Board.
7 During my time I would like to share some of FTB's
8 continued work to advance engagement with taxpayers,
9 tax professionals, and stakeholders throughout
10 California. In the coming months, FTB will
11 participate with several outreach events across the
12 state, including small business expos and hosted
13 events. For example, we will connect with the Latino
14 business owners at an event in Long Beach and share
15 tax updates with the California Society of Tax
16 Consultants through upcoming sessions in San Diego
17 and Orange County. We also look forward to
18 participating in the Annual Virtual Income Tax
19 Seminar next month, which is hosted by the California
20 Lawyers Association. It will include panels on the
21 Settlement Bureau, residency issues in California,
22 the Pass-Through Entity elective tax, and an
23 open-ended life panel called "Ask the Experts." In
24 August, the Advisory Board Meeting will convene as an
25 important forum for collaboration and stakeholder

1 feedback as we work together to address issues
2 affecting California taxpayers and tax programs. We
3 look forward to the Controller coming and sharing
4 opening remarks at this event. And in the summer,
5 FTB will celebrate the successful completion of the
6 EDR2 project and the significant contributions of the
7 staff and our partners who helped bring this
8 transformational endeavor to fruition. Once again,
9 we look forward to the Controller coming and sharing
10 opening remarks at this event, as well.

11 Also I would like to take a brief moment
12 to highlight some of our volunteer activities we do
13 at FTB. So I would like to recognize the Legal
14 Division's internship program -- volunteer program
15 and express my Sincere gratitude to all our interns,
16 some of whom are in the audience today. So
17 interns -- legal interns, if you're in the audience,
18 want to stand up and be acknowledged. We have two
19 over here. We have three over here. No, go ahead.
20 Controller's office interns as well. And then we
21 have one over here as well. Thank you.

22 So we appreciate the enthusiasm, talent,
23 and dedication you bring to FTB and the meaningful
24 contributions you make by learning more about tax law
25 and public service. Thank you Legal for the intern

1 coordinators and all their mentors whose time, and
2 guidance, and encouragement make this such a rich and
3 rewarding learning experience for them. So these
4 mentors have to do a full-time job as being attorneys
5 and plus also help the interns as well. So thank
6 you.

7 And finally, thank you Controller, Board,
8 and your staff for your invaluable support and
9 guidance through another demanding tax season and of
10 course beyond. Your strategic commitment, your
11 unwavering dedication to the FTB have helped us
12 navigate challenges and achieve our goals beyond
13 measure. We, as a team, our entire FTB, are grateful
14 for your continued leadership. Thank you.

15 CHAIR COHEN: Does that conclude your
16 presentation?

17 MS. STANISLAUS: Yes.

18 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. Are there any
19 members of the public that would like to comment on
20 the presentation that's in the chamber? All right.

21 Seeing none, we will go to public comment
22 online.

23 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
24 on the phone line, if you would like to place
25 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a

1 reminder, you may press 1 and 0 at this time.

2 And at this time, no members of the
3 public are queueing up. Please continue.

4 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
5 much.

6 Member Lieber, did you have any comments?
7 I forgot to check in with you.

8 MS. LIEBER: Not on this item.

9 CHAIR COHEN: Okay.

10 MS. LIEBER: Under board member comments,
11 yes.

12 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you.
13 Then let's go ahead to our final item.

14 Ms. Rubalcava, could you please call Item 8?

15 MS. RUBALCAVA: Yes.

16 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you.

17 MS. RUBALCAVA: Members, Item 8 is Board
18 Members' Time, and I will turn it over to Controller
19 Cohen.

20 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you. I
21 appreciate that. All right, Member Lieber, you're
22 up.

23 MS. LIEBER: Thank you so much. Well,
24 I'd like to start by thanking our Chair and our
25 executive officer and staff for the productive and

1 substantive and engaging conversation today. I think
2 that's where we need to be in terms of showing our
3 constituents that we care about the issues that
4 affect them the most. And I'm very much looking
5 forward to the Earned Income Tax Credit questions
6 that we had returning, as well as the questions
7 relating to collections.

8 I would like to also put into the hopper
9 for items that I think we should consider as very
10 relevant to our work. In looking at appeals -- at
11 the timelines of appeals that take place and the
12 amounts of the -- of money in question that is being
13 discussed, and really unpack those lower amounts of
14 money and the time that they take to make their way
15 through the appeals process. And that's of great
16 interest to people on all ends of the economic scale.
17 I've heard about it from a number of constituents,
18 and I think it's right for us to discuss that. I'd
19 also like to, when time allows later in the year,
20 look at having a 90-minute holistic hearing about the
21 situation of people that fit into the economic strata
22 that is closest to receiving our tax credits and are
23 also adjacent to that. The affordability crisis in
24 California is moving through our state like a prairie
25 fire, and it's literally impacting people who have no

1 other choice to leave. Because they no longer have
2 the funds to be able to leave our state. There's a
3 lot of discussion about people leaving California and
4 going to Texas or going to southern states. But
5 there are a lot more people in the millions who
6 cannot afford to leave California, and yet, are
7 finding themselves squeezed and squeezed and squeezed
8 with this boia constructor of our current economic
9 conditions, particularly with federal changes. So
10 when time allows, I'd like to take 90 minutes to hear
11 about that and to convey our concern as well. So
12 thank you so much.

13 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you,
14 Member Lieber. We're happy to support you on those
15 efforts.

16 First, I just want to acknowledge last
17 Friday was Juneteenth. Did you guys have a good time
18 celebrating? Yes, I rested. I enjoyed my rest. But
19 Juneteenth is an important holiday. As many of you
20 all know, it's when the men -- Juneteenth marks a day
21 in 1865 when Union soldiers arrived in Galveston,
22 Texas, and announced to enslaved people that they
23 were free, more than two years after the Emancipation
24 Proclamation had already been signed. This
25 particular occasion is important to me on a personal

1 note, because my paternal grandmother was born in
2 Galveston, Texas. And so we still have a lot --
3 significant amount of family that live and reside in
4 the Galveston, Texas area. So we
5 always internally -- before it was a federal
6 holiday -- we would acknowledge June 10th.

7 Also, I want to move on and I want to
8 return to something that happened last week on June
9 15. One week ago, a United States Air Force B-52
10 crashed at Edwards Air Force Base. And this is a
11 base that's located in Kern County. Sadly, all eight
12 people on board were killed. Recently, the names of
13 those that we lost have been released, and I'd like
14 to read them into record because they deserve
15 recognition for their service.

16 I want to recognize Colonel Gregory
17 Watson, 53 years old, of Shreveport, Louisiana.
18 Lieutenant Colonel Gabriel Estrella, 40 years old.
19 The retired Lieutenant Colonel Miles Middleton,
20 50 years old. He was a Boeing pilot and a veteran
21 who served in Afghanistan. Major Alexander Davis was
22 34 years old of Lancaster, California, and was a
23 weapon systems officer. Major Robert Dee, 40 years
24 old, a pilot with the 419th Flight Test Squadron.
25 Major Brad Hovey, 35 years old of Iowa. He was also

1 a pilot with the 419th Flight Test Squadron.

2 Jeromy Smith, 32, of Rosemont, California, a flight
3 test engineer with the 419th Flight Test Squadron.

4 And finally, Christopher Rischar, 41 years old, of
5 Lancaster, California, was a flight test engineer and
6 contractor with the JT4.

7 So on behalf of this board, I just want
8 to extend our deepest condolences for each of the
9 families, their colleagues at the Edwards Air Force
10 Base, and to everyone whose life was touched by the
11 loss of these souls. May they rest in peace, and may
12 California never forget the sacrifice they've made on
13 our soil.

14 And in closing, finally, I want to just
15 take a moment to introduce a group of folks that have
16 joined our team, the State Controller's Office, our
17 summer internship interns. I'm genuinely excited
18 about welcoming them. Like the FTB, we are training
19 the future and inspiring people for public service.
20 And what more of an inspiring way than to force them
21 to come to the Franchise Tax Board Meeting, and sit
22 through all of the very, very, very important work
23 that we are doing. I'm so excited for all of the
24 interns, but I want to recognize Larry Bai who is a
25 political science student at UC Santa Barbara. And

1 then I also want to recognize Natalie Williams from
2 Northeastern University, and then also
3 Michelle Bloom, who's here joining us from UCLA.
4 These are our super stars this summer. We are lucky
5 to have you. Thank you. And I truly hope that all
6 of the interns will have an experience that will give
7 them a genuine window into state government,
8 particularly into what public financial oversight
9 looks like, and into the difference that dedicated
10 people in public service, how they can make a
11 difference every single day. We are very lucky to
12 have you. Thank you very much for joining us.

13 And in closing, happy Father's Day to all
14 the men that serve as fathers' inspiration,
15 godfather, uncles, stepfathers those that are just
16 stepping in. We're very grateful. I've got a great
17 relationship. I'm a daddy's girl. So Father's Day
18 is really important in our house.

19 So with that, I'm going to close out.
20 And thank you for joining us. It's -- oh, public
21 comment. Any member of the public that are in the
22 chamber that would like to speak? Okay. We're
23 sticking with the theme. Nobody has anything to say.
24 I got it.

25 Operator, please check the public comment

1 online.

2 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Members of the public
3 on the phone lines, if you would like to place
4 yourself in the queue for public comment, as a
5 reminder, you may press 1 then 0 at this time. And
6 you have a comment from Christine Grab, individual
7 taxpayer.

8 Please go ahead.

9 MS. GRAB: At the April 2026 Board
10 Meeting Hasib Emran, with Malia Cohen's tacit
11 blessing, utilized and underhanded tactic to violate
12 my taxpayer right to comment on Susan Maples'
13 retirement. This is my belated comment. Do not
14 violate my right to speak again. I spoke with
15 Susan Maples on the phone a few times, and we
16 exchanged several emails. She seems like a lovely
17 person. Her successor, Chris Smith, stated that
18 Ms. Maples was framed for fraud, in accordance with
19 FTB standard operating procedure whereby the legal
20 department sets up employees in other departments as
21 patsies for crimes perpetrated by the attorneys.
22 There is a reason why the attorneys don't sign
23 documents themselves. There is no statute of
24 limitations --

25 CHAIR COHEN: Ms. Grab, I love your

1 comment. But I cannot allow you to publicly attack a
2 staff member. I cannot allow you to publicly attack
3 a staff member. So I'm not squelching or impeding on
4 your right to public comment. If you'd like to make
5 it positive, I can give you two minutes back. Or you
6 may direct your comments to the full Board.

7 THE AT&T OPERATOR: Once again, please
8 press 1 and 0, if you have a comment.

9 And no members of the public are queueing
10 up at this time. Please continue.

11 CHAIR COHEN: All right. Thank you very
12 much ladies and gentlemen, we are adjourned.

13 (Whereupon, the proceeding
14 concluded at 12:52 p.m.)

15 -o0o-
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

I, the undersigned, a Certified Electronic Reporter of the State of California, do hereby certify:

That the foregoing electronically-recorded proceedings were transcribed by me to the best of my ability.

I further certify I am neither financially interested in the action nor a relative or employee of any attorney or party to this action.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I hereunto subscribe my name this 6th day of July, 2026



Brandon Iorlano
CA-CER No. 4221

ERRATA LIST

Page/Line

From

To